

**The Version of Record of this manuscript has been published and is available in:**  
**“Addenda: One Middle English Manuscript and Four Editions of Medieval Works Known to J.R.R. Tolkien and What They Reveal.”** *ANQ: A Quarterly Journal of Short Articles, Notes and Reviews*, vol. 36, no. 2, 2023, pp. 164-171, doi:10.1080/0895769X.2021.1932406. [Advance online publication 2021]

**Addenda: One Middle English Manuscript and Four Editions of Medieval Works Known to J. R. R. Tolkien and What They Reveal**

Andoni Cossio<sup>a\*</sup> ORCID: [0000-0003-2745-5104](https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2745-5104)

*<sup>a</sup>Department of English, German and Translation and Interpretation, University of the Basque Country (UPV/EHU), Vitoria-Gasteiz, Spain*

\*Postal address:

c/ Paseo de la Universidad, 5  
01006 Vitoria-Gasteiz  
Álava, Spain

Email address:

[andoni.cossio@ehu.eus](mailto:andoni.cossio@ehu.eus)

Andoni Cossio (UPV/EHU) is working on a PhD dissertation entitled *The Evolution of J. R. R. Tolkien's Ecological Perspective through the Portrayal of Trees and Forests: From The Hobbit to The Lord of the Rings*. He is sponsored by the Pre-doctoral Funding (PRE\_2017\_1\_0210 MOD.:A), financed by the Basque Government, and by the research group REWEST (IT-1026-16), funded by the Basque Government and the University of the Basque Country (UPV/EHU). His publications focus on nature in Tolkien's oeuvre and he has organized seven international conferences on the Inklings in Spain. ORCID: [0000-0003-2745-5104](https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2745-5104), [ehu.academia.edu/AndoniCossio](http://ehu.academia.edu/AndoniCossio).

## **Addenda: One Middle English Manuscript and Four Editions of Medieval Works Known to J. R. R. Tolkien and What They Reveal**

This article proposes the addition of four items to “Section A” of Oronzo Cilli’s *Tolkien’s Library: An Annotated Checklist* (2019) and the inclusion of complementary information to two other entries after demonstrating J. R. R. Tolkien’s ownership and acquaintance with the volumes. Tolkien’s contribution to Derek J. Price’s editorial labor and possession of photostats of *The Equatorie of the Planetis* (c. 1393) as well as editions of *Handlyng Synne* (started in 1303), *Ormulum* (c. 1170-1180) and *Heimskringla* (c. 1220-1230) seem mere encyclopedic data in appearance. However, the addenda reveal strong potential for future investigations by disclosing: the reasons behind Tolkien’s personal interest in scribal corruption, an attempt to anglicize Old Norse *dróttkvætt* verse, the whereabouts of a batch of twenty to thirty books owned by him, further scholarly attention paid to *Handlyng Synne* and *Ormulum*, and Christopher Tolkien’s friendship with Eric Christiansen.

Keywords: J. R. R. Tolkien; *The Equatorie of the Planetis*; *Heimskringla*; *Handlyng Synne*; *Ormulum*; Christopher Tolkien; Eric Christiansen.

“Section A” of Oronzo Cilli’s *Tolkien’s Library: An Annotated Checklist* (2019) has become an indispensable resource for J. R. R. Tolkien scholars as it compiles a comprehensive list of works that Tolkien owned, borrowed, read, annotated or bought as presents (1-326). Cilli is aware that the information and list in “Section A” remain incomplete and that it will become more inclusive in subsequent editions (*Tolkien’s* xxiii-xxiv; “Leaves” unpaginated). Shortly after the book appeared, Cilli provided a few discoveries and entries to be incorporated in the future (“Addenda” unpaginated). Reviewers of the book have also proposed several additions either to this list or to other complementary information that accompanies the entries (Scull and Hammond, Review 3, 5; Croft 204-05; Eden 79-81; Cossio 201).

This article presents four new addenda to the list and complements two more entries by demonstrating Tolkien's ownership and knowledge of the volumes. Tolkien's contribution to Derek J. Price's editorial labor and possession of photostats of *The Equatorie of the Planetis* (c. 1393) as well as editions of *Handlyng Synne* (started in 1303), *Ormulum* (c. 1170-1180) and *Heimskringla* (c. 1220-1230) seem mere encyclopedic data in appearance. However, the addenda reveal strong potential for future investigations by disclosing: the reasons behind Tolkien's personal interest in scribal corruption, an attempt to anglicize Old Norse *dróttkvætt* verse, the whereabouts of a batch of twenty to thirty books owned by him, further scholarly attention paid to *Handlyng Synne* and *Ormulum*, and Christopher Tolkien's friendship with Eric Christiansen.

The first two items are tied to a project to which Tolkien offered his assistance between c. 1951-1955. Price and R. M. Wilson consulted Tolkien when preparing an edition of *The Equatorie of the Planetis* (Price xvi). John M. Bowers reports that Tolkien owned twenty-five photostats of the manuscript containing the M(iddle) E(nglish) work that were later donated to the English Faculty Library upon retirement (214). As will be explained below, owing to Tolkien's personal interest in the manuscript, it is safe to assume that he read part of, if not all, the edition, either while it was being composed or once in published form. This adds two new works read by Tolkien to Cilli's "Section A":

- (1) Westwyk, John. Peterhouse MS. 75. I. [Contains *The Equatorie of the Planetis*]. c.1393. Fols. 1r-78v. Preserved at Peterhouse College, University of Cambridge, Cambridge.

Notes: Twenty-five large photostats of individual pages of the manuscript which belonged to Tolkien are preserved at Special Collections of the Weston Library, Bodleian Libraries, University of Oxford (Tolkien VC 277). Eight pages are

tables, fifteen pages contain text, in some cases interspersed by circular diagrams, one contains a single line at the bottom and another is possibly a cover. Together with the photostats there are four newspaper clippings on the discovery of the manuscript, gathered by Tolkien, which are kept along with the photostats, those being:

-Onions, C. T. "*The Equatorie of the Planetis.*" *The Times Literary Supplement.*

7 Mar. 1952, p. 173.

-"Possible Chaucer Manuscript: Discovery at Cambridge." *The Times.* 28 Feb.

1952, p. 6.

-Price, Derek. "*The Equatorie of the Planetis*–I." *The Times Literary Supplement.*

29 Feb. 1952, p. 164.

-Price, Derek. "*The Equatorie of the Planetis*–II." *The Times Literary Supplement.*

7 Mar. 1952, p. 180.

(2) Westwyk, John. *The Equatorie of the Planetis: Edited from Peterhouse MS.*

75. I. Edited by Derek J. Price and R. M. Wilson. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1955.

Though years after Tolkien's demise Kari Anne Rand has discovered the manuscript to be John Westwyk's holograph (15-35), Price and Wilson argued at the time that it was the first manuscript in Geoffrey Chaucer's hand ever to emerge. The discovery of this manuscript was truly relevant for Tolkien; the craving for an autograph of Chaucer had never left him, and the newspaper clippings he collected on the discovery of the manuscript from *The Times* and *The Times Literary Supplement* testify to this eagerness. Bowers explains that Tolkien wished to discover the original word forms and spellings

employed by Chaucer because he believed these had been corrupted by the medieval author's scribes (214).<sup>1</sup> Tolkien's interest in this manuscript is understandable as it strengthened his hypothesis that scholars looking for original forms should not trust those scribes,<sup>2</sup> as he conveyed in "Chaucer as a Philologist: *The Reeves Tale*" (1934) and also in his 1939 edition of the tale where he emended the alleged erroneous scribal forms.<sup>3</sup> The preface to *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight* (c. 1400), edited by Tolkien and E. V. Gordon (1925), further expresses Tolkien's mistrust, clarifying that the linguistic side of the edition aims at providing "the meaning of the author's actual words (in so far as the manuscript is fair to him)" (vi, see also 105, 121; Tolkien, *Gawain* 201). But perhaps the best example is found in "An Introduction on Language," a few lines Tolkien drafted to precede the notes section of his unfinished *Selections from Chaucer's Poetry and Prose*:

The language of these selections from Chaucer is substantially that of the latter part of the fourteenth century. It must not, however, be overlooked that our extant copies, in varying degrees according to their age and carefulness, have at haphazard altered Chaucer's language not only in spellings but also in accidence, syntax and even occasionally in vocabulary, in conformity with the uses of a later century. In the process they have often doubtless disregarded the finer points of style and versification; sometimes they have obviously neglected metre altogether. If we had Chaucer's own autographs, or copies certainly seen and passed by him, we should of course find a language more uniform (and somewhat more uniformly archaic) than that presented by these selections drawn from various Mss. of various dates. (Bowers 279)

The most important point raised by Tolkien's interest in *The Equatorie of the Planetis* is that his staunch support for the theory that Chaucer's work suffers from scribal corruption finds parallels in Tolkien's own problems with the editors/typesetters/proofreaders of his literary works, mainly owing to his idiosyncratic spellings. Rayner Unwin, when giving an account of publishing Tolkien's works, remarks the "impossible perfection that

Tolkien always strove towards” (29).<sup>4</sup> This personal trait partly explains his fixation with scribal alterations in his scholarship; scribal corruption is well recorded, but medieval authors were not the infallible creators that Tolkien sometimes pretended them to be.<sup>5</sup>

But is there any particular reason for Tolkien in c. 1951-1955 to be more eager to prove his point? A scribe, as a modern editor/proofreader/typesetter, may introduce changes, wrongly in many cases Tolkien would say, in order to improve the text.<sup>6</sup> Tolkien may have empathized with those hypothetical corruptions he had been subjected to throughout his literary career as it will be seen below. However, whereas Tolkien was able to reverse or alter many of the changes, medieval authors, especially when their works were posthumously copied, were not given the redemptive chance of correction. Tolkien, already having some thoughts about his literary legacy must have felt strongly about this both at personal and professional level.

His perfectionist tendencies became conspicuous during the publication *The Hobbit* (1937). Upon scrutinizing the first set of proofs, he urged his publisher Allen & Unwin to replace entire passages and also correct a few type-setting errors (Unwin 26). This led to the printers’ decision to produce a revised set of proofs where Tolkien, aside from correcting some narrative issues, spotted another batch of type-setting errors that had not been emended (27). Nevertheless, as soon as *The Hobbit* was published, Tolkien was already lamenting the use of the plural ‘dwarves’ throughout and wished he had replaced it (27; Tolkien, *Letters* 23-24), though later, he fully embraced its use (26, 169, 313). The matter escalated and, soon after, a revision of *The Hobbit* was in progress. In a letter to Allen & Unwin on 4 February 1938, Tolkien forwards a list of corrections he paid his son Christopher to find (*Letters* 28), which of course must have been rechecked by the author.

His many revisions of *The Hobbit* and *The Lord of the Rings* (1954-1955, hereinafter *LotR*) made him despair at the new errors inserted.<sup>7</sup> At the time he was collaborating in the edition of *The Equatorie of the Planetis*, on 4 August 1953 Tolkien wrote to his son Christopher complaining about the typesetters' unauthorized corrections in the galley-proofs of *The Fellowship of the Ring* (1954): "the impertinent compositors have taken it upon themselves to correct, as they suppose, my spelling and grammar: altering throughout *dwarves* to *dwarfs*; *elvish* to *elfish*; *further* to *farther*; and worst of all, *elven-* to *elfin*" (*Letters* 169). Tolkien felt entitled to challenge the rules of English spelling to suit his informed taste. The difference between 'elfin' and 'elven' was a crucial matter to him. This led to the addition of a note on his distinctive spelling choices in the 1966 Longmans Green & Company edition of *The Hobbit*. His sentiments are well conveyed in a letter dated 7 August 1954 where he rants about the problem:

I am afraid there are still a number of 'misprints' in Vol. I [*The Fellowship of the Ring*]! Including the one on p. 166. But *nasturtians* is deliberate, and represents a final triumph over the high-handed printers. Jarrold's appear to have a highly educated pedant as a chief proof-reader, and they started correcting my English without reference to me: *elfin* for *elven*; *farther* for *further*; *try to say* for *try and say* and so on. I was put to the trouble of proving to him his own ignorance, as well as rebuking his impertinence. (*Letters* 183)

A similar complaint was sent to Unwin on 30 December 1961 after examining an edition of *The Hobbit* published by Puffin Books in September 1961 because typesetters or proofreaders had altered his idiosyncratic spelling and introduced a number of careless errors (*Letters* 312-13). All this evidence is sufficient proof, even for sceptics, of the link between a theory he endorsed in his professional sphere and the ubiquitous nuisance he had to face during his literary career. Yet it is even more important to realize that by discovering the texts he read, owned and knew, we are able to step forward in the long journey of understanding Tolkien better as a person and a writer.

The following additions transport us to c. September 1975, New College, Oxford, when Christopher Tolkien (1924-2020) resigned his position as Fellow and Tutor of New College (1964-1975) and left for Provence, Southern France, to devote his life to the arduous editorial work of publishing his father's writings. Douglas A. Anderson's account reveals that Christopher had inherited his father's library after the latter's death (361). Christopher, while keeping the remainder, donated approximately three hundred items from his father's holdings to the English Faculty Library and around forty-five to the Bodleian Library, in addition to Tolkien senior's papers, before he left the United Kingdom permanently (Cilli *Tolkien's* xix-xx; Anderson 361-62). Cilli records other moments when J. R. R. Tolkien disposed of items from his library during his life and where those may be found (*Tolkien's* xix-xxiii).

One can only gather from Cilli that Christopher had never parted with any other copy before or after those two donations to the university and another batch that was sold after his father's death in the second-hand market (xxii-xxiii; Anderson 361-62). However, a personal interview with Dr. Rafael J. Pascual,<sup>8</sup> Junior Research Fellow in English of New College, revealed that Christopher did indeed dispose of an additional batch. While vacating his rooms in New College, Christopher gave, in token of friendship, around twenty to thirty of his father's books, mainly older editions of ME texts,<sup>9</sup> to Eric Christiansen (1937-2016), New College Fellow in Medieval History (1965-2002, mainly Northern history in the Middle Ages).<sup>10</sup> Christiansen was a lifelong friend of Christopher<sup>11</sup> and used to visit him in the south of France.

It can be presumed and in one case confirmed that Christopher had been using those books while his college teaching duties lasted,<sup>12</sup> but it is highly unlikely that the volumes had been of any use to Christiansen's teaching or research. Shortly before Christiansen retired when he was clearing out his rooms, with the students and other



fellows of English in mind, he offered the college the complete batch of books, but only three volumes were accepted. The unusualness of the editions in some way prompted their acceptance, as the others were probably common ME editions of which they already had enough copies.

The author of this paper conjectures that Christopher passed them on to Christiansen when he left his rooms because he thought them of standard value and of no future use to him. This of course is supposition, but it seems likely enough. That Christiansen's books were, except for three, common copies, may explain why Christopher donated approximately three hundred items from his father's holdings to the English Faculty Library and around forty-five to the Bodleian Library and still left twenty to thirty to his friend who had no need of them. At that point, although Tolkien was already well-known, Christopher may not have conceived that the books were worth much more than their mere scholarly value. Thus, if the aforementioned were mostly common, it is understandable that the books were not donated to the Bodleian Libraries' vast holdings of editions of medieval works.

The contents of the entire batch of books are unknown except for four copies that have recently been discovered. The first of them, not listed by Cilli, surfaced in 2019 and confirms Dr. Pascual's account of Christiansen receiving from Christopher a number of books belonging to the latter's father. Around 1979, Roberta Frank received a typescript from Christiansen containing an unpublished poem in modern English structured as an Old Norse *dróttkvætt*<sup>13</sup> verse (398n3). The poem was by J. R. R. Tolkien and was found within an Old Norse edition and translation that had belonged to him, later to Christopher and was now in Christiansen's possession (398n3),<sup>14</sup> namely:

(3) Sturluson, Snorri. *Heimskringla: The Stories of the Kings of Norway*, vol. 1. Series: The Saga Library, vol. 3. Edited and translated by William Morris and Eiríkr Magnússon. London: Bernard Quaritch, 1893.

Description: Contains three stanzas in J. R. R. Tolkien's hand, one of them being a *dróttkvætt* verse in modern English, the others' types are unknown and unreproduced. The current location of the book remains a mystery.

It is regrettable that this copy was sold by Christiansen and its whereabouts are no longer known, so the other two stanzas will stay unpublished and their verse forms and contents undisclosed until the copy comes to light once again. However, the book and the poem, aside from proving that Christiansen certainly did receive the books also reveal a new work owned by J. R. R. Tolkien that testifies to his experimentation with the characteristic Old Norse *dróttkvætt* stanza. This discovery leads to the more important question of whether this was a mere one-time trial or a verse pattern exercised in other poetic productions, hitherto discovered or undiscovered. Furthermore, of note would be Christopher's use of the book as an aid to his rigorous Old Norse tutoring and scholarly endeavours,<sup>15</sup> although no references to this are currently known among his publications.

The next volume Tolkien is known to have possessed is an edition of the ME work *Handlyng Synne*. The only rigorous evidence that Cilli provides of Tolkien's knowledge of the book is its appearance in fols. 38-39 of *Notes on Pearl* (MS. Tolkien A 11), deposited at Special Collections of the Weston Library, Bodleian Libraries [University of Oxford] (182). Although the reference includes parts one and two, only the possession of part one has been ascertained, whilst part two, expected to have been owned by Tolkien, amounts to a pure supposition:

(4) Mannyng of Brunne, Robert. *Handlyng Synne*, Pt. I. Series: E.E.T.S. (Early English Text Society), OS 119. Edited by Frederick James Furnivall. London: Published for the Early English Text Society by Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner and Co., 1901.

Description: Signed on the front flyleaf, towards the top middle of the page, in a brownish black ink “J. R. R. Tolkien”, underlined, with the underlining stretching from the second “R” to the end of the surname. No year. No address. Contains few marginal notes in pencil in Tolkien’s not very legible hand and these are beside the text, mainly on the rhymes, brief and mainly philological. There is one torn slip of notepaper between pp. 118-19 with scribbles by Tolkien on both sides. One side, which this author takes to be the reverse, has (from right to left) “Swerting” in black ink, crossed out, then written sideways in pencil “fully excerpted up to 3396” followed by the date “Feb 14 [or 19?] 1928,” then a partly illegible word in pencil (“trebel?”) crossed out in ink. On the other side there appear to be the tops of two columns, written in pencil, the left hand one is headed “Evy Year” and underneath “& Hilary” underlined in pencil; the right-hand column is headed “Alternating” underneath which is “Verse of AS Reader 1” with a tick, and underneath that “OE texts 1” with another tick; these two are bracketed to the right and to the right of the bracket is written “Beowulf 2” in a circle with a tick. This author judges that Tolkien is reminding himself of an Old English exam syllabus with set texts. Book number four is housed at New College, Oxford.

In Kenneth Sisam’s *Fourteenth Century Verse & Prose* (1921), out of the 12638 lines that the complete *Handlyng Synne* contains Tolkien only glossed ll. 8987-9251,<sup>16</sup> which

narrate a passage known in modern times as “The Dancers of Colbek” (4-12). Sisam’s edition is based on Furnivall’s (4). Therefore, it is not improbable that Tolkien decided to purchase an edition that would assist him in the glossator’s task. Three years after glossing the passage, in the brief note named “Some Contributions to Middle-English Lexicography” (1925), Tolkien proposed a corrected meaning for the phrase *long home* in l. 9195 of *Handlyng Synne* (210). Sometime later, his notes about the ME poem *Pearl* (c.1400) mention Furnivall’s edition, testifying to his use of both volumes for his philological work. The work continued to draw his attention. Fols. 53-54 of the first box containing the item MS. Tolkien A 23, preserved at Special Collections of the Weston Library, Bodleian Libraries (University of Oxford), include several hasty philological notes on *Handlyng Synne*. The year 1928 scribbled on the torn slip inside the book may date the composition of the jottings in fols. 53-54 of MS. Tolkien A 23 or others (fols. 38-39 of MS. Tolkien A 11), but it remains unknown.

Tolkien’s stint as a glossator of the work and his brief effort on its language reflect a fleeting use of the volume, whereas in Christopher’s case whether he even opened it stays unrevealed. It is possible that *Handlyng Synne* has only been a complementary text that has never enjoyed a central role in Oxford syllabi, and therefore seldom taught, if ever, by college tutors. In contrast, the last two volumes were far more focal in Oxford’s academic circles:

(5) Ormin. *The Ormulum*, vol. 1. With the Glossary of Dr. R. M. White and edited by Rev. Robert Holt. Oxford: At the Clarendon Press, 1878.

(6) Ormin. *The Ormulum*, vol. 2. With the Glossary of Dr. R. M. White and edited by Rev. Robert Holt. Oxford: At the Clarendon Press, 1878.

Description: No signature in either volume.<sup>17</sup> No sign of anyone's ownership but their provenance is unquestionable. There are brief marginal annotations in pencil, some faded and not very legible, mainly in the glossary, deletion of etymologies, comments on forms, and the like, but few in the text, chiefly philological and mostly in Tolkien's hand but some also in Christopher's, as both taught the language of the *Ormulum*. Not all the marginalia are in English, some in Greek. Tolkien has numbered the gospel texts listed in vol. 1. There are three fragile and deteriorating slips no longer inserted in their original pages. Two are covered in notes, lists of words and references, in black ink and pencil mainly, but a red biro too at one point, all in Tolkien's hand. The third, not well covered, has a few words on one side in Tolkien's hand and on the head of the other side 'Rough notes' with another line in Christopher's hand. Volumes number five and six are housed at New College, Oxford.

The edition in two volumes is included in Cilli's "Section A" as a single item, number 2465 (*Tolkien's* 308). The bibliographic entry is not accurate, and the only evidence provided is its inclusion in the bibliography of the second revised edition of Tolkien and Gordon's *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight* (1967), which was undertaken by Norman Davis (Cilli, *Tolkien's* 308). However, the annotations and deteriorated bits of paper are a strong enough evidence to confirm both Tolkien's and Christopher's ownership and use of the volumes, which can be bolstered by the following considerations. Tolkien lectured on the *Ormulum* in all three terms during the academic year 1946-1947 and a term in 1951 (365-66). He supervised from 1951 until 1957 R. W. Burchfield's D. Phil. unfinished thesis entitled *The Vocabulary and Phonology of the Ormulum* (346; Scull and Hammond, *Reader's Guide, Part II* 968). In 1961, Tolkien was studying the *Ormulum*

again for some unspecified purpose, as he questioned Burchfield regarding a given interpretation (*Chronology* 601). Tolkien never published any of his findings on the *Ormulum*, but MS. Tolkien A 10/2 1 box [84 leaves], named “Drafts of articles or lectures, and rough notes, on *Ormulum*, n.d.,” contains a wealth of information on its language, phonology and spelling.<sup>18</sup> However, the only edition of the work he is known to have owned is the first edition of Henry Sweet’s *First Middle English Primer* (1884) which contains annotations in six pages (Cilli, *Tolkien’s* 281).<sup>19</sup> This edition only contains the fragments “Dedication” ll. 1-335 and “Homilies” ll. 962-1667 (Sweet 48-81) from the 20068 lines of the incomplete whole that survives. The extracts in Sweet’s little primer, given the difficulty of obtaining White and Holt’s, may have been used as passages for exam purposes and therefore used by the students, but would not have satisfied the needs of a professor of English philology interested in, lecturing on, and supervising a D. Phil. thesis about the *Ormulum*. Moreover, the extracts in Sweet’s edition are based on White and Holt’s (vi), which currently remains the most modern and complete volume.<sup>20</sup> This provides a further reason for Tolkien to own the source text indicated above and for Christopher to have made use of it in his own teaching whilst holding a position as a tutor, as it was a set text in ME language for many years.

It is probable that Tolkien owned White’s previous edition published in 1852 in order to compare White and Holt’s with White’s first attempt at editing the work, yet this is mere speculation and therefore not included in this article. Tolkien may have also found the work appealing because the *Ormulum* is the author’s holograph and thus less affected by scribal corruption. Undoubtedly, his chief interest lay in the philological value of the *Ormulum* for its unique inflections and especially because the text indicates vowel length with its idiosyncratic spelling and diacritics (see Sweet 43-47). It is also important to bear

in mind that this fascinating text was much discussed in Oxford medieval English circles in Tolkien's time.

As stated at the beginning, it is this author's belief that these four additions and complementary information to two other entries could offer other scholars aside from mere encyclopedic data a starting point for further studies. Among those potential explorations, perhaps the most interesting discovery would be that of the titles that completed Christiansen's batch. Christiansen is known to have sold the remainder at some unspecified date for a high price. Sadly, without any further details, and especially if the books were not publicly auctioned and therefore listed, the items in that collection remain undisclosed. Even if the original buyers turn vendors, the content of the rest of the batch of between twenty to thirty books will remain a mystery unless the public sale is announced and Christiansen's former ownership identified.

I would like to express my gratitude to Dr. Rafael J. Pascual for letting me know about the books housed at New College and for agreeing to be interviewed on their historical background. I would also like to thank Catherine McIlwaine (Tolkien Archivist at the Bodleian Libraries, University of Oxford) for her generous assistance.

This essay was completed under the auspices of the Pre-doctoral Funding (PRE\_2017\_1\_0210 MOD.:A), financed by the Basque Government, and REWEST research group (IT 1026-16), funded by both the Basque Government and the University of the Basque Country (UPV/EHU).

---

## Notes

<sup>1</sup> See Bowers (187-211, especially 214-15). Tolkien's views on the matter appeared in print as early as 1926: "It is at least arguable that we should sooner cry the mangle upon the scalps of scribes than build too loftily upon their laziness" ("Philology" 64).

<sup>2</sup> Tom Shippey has formerly discussed Tolkien's tendency: "It was the job of the true scholar, Tolkien thought—he exemplifies it frequently in his edition of the Old English *Exodus* and the 'Finnsburg' poems—to rescue poems and myths from their careless or uncomprehending scribes and annotators" ("Light-Elves" 5; "Cruces" 111). Bowers also discusses Tolkien's fixation at length (85-89, 92, 155, 169, 198-203, 210-13). See Leonard Neidorf for a critical summary of Tolkien's views on scribal corruption and possible emendations in *Beowulf* (*Transmission* 165-72).

<sup>3</sup> Tolkien's annotated copy of his edition (Tolkien VC Pamph [10]) is house at Special Collections of the Weston Library, Bodleian Libraries (University of Oxford), reprinted in *Tolkien Studies*

(Tolkien, “*Reeve’s*” 173-83). Tolkien undertook a similar task some years later when editing *Sir Orfeo* (1944). The goal was to reconstruct a text closer to a presumably lost original with a more metrical result. His editorial note to the edition explains his efforts to rearrange word order, among other changes, and to emend spellings and use of final -e so as to suit those of Southern ME, which he considered to be the original dialect of composition (Tolkien and Hostetter 104, see 105-19 for the specific changes). Tolkien was also bothered by the use of double-line thorns (þ) in *Ancrene Riwe* (c. 1200) of Cotton MS Titus: “a hideous and totally inaccurate letter, apparently derived (clumsily) from later debased hands – inexcusable” (Scull and Hammond, *Chronology* 591-92).

<sup>4</sup> See John D. Rateliff for an example of the discrepancy between *The Hobbit* and *The Lord of the Rings* regarding Kili and Fili’s age that was never corrected by Tolkien (355-56).

<sup>5</sup> As Neidorf’s lucid article demonstrates, Tolkien was not blind to the faults of certain medieval authors, whose works he tried to correct and unify to create a consistent Arthurian legend for modern readers in *The Fall of Arthur* [2013] (“Tolkien’s” 91-113).

<sup>6</sup> See Rateliff for a proofreader/printer’s suggested emendation and query concerning one of Tolkien’s revisions for the text of *The Hobbit* c. 1965 and Tolkien’s detailed answers to preserve his intended wording (898-900).

<sup>7</sup> See Wayne G. Hammond and Douglas A. Anderson for a comprehensive account of the numerous misprints introduced into editions of *The Hobbit* (4-45) and *LotR* (97-144) while Tolkien was alive.

<sup>8</sup> Unless otherwise noted, the source for the information from this point onwards stems from the personal interview with Dr. Pascual.

<sup>9</sup> At New College, Christopher Tolkien tutored ME language and literature to undergraduates, and also non-compulsory courses such as Old Norse for future medievalists (Pascual, “*Manners*” 12).

<sup>10</sup> Before that, Spanish military history of the early modern period (nineteenth century) was his research area.

<sup>11</sup> See Richard Ovenden (116).

<sup>12</sup> However, it is improbable that book number four, *Handlyng Synne*, was ever a set text in the Oxford syllabus.

<sup>13</sup> An Old Norse verse form characteristic of court poetry. This type of stanza usually consists of eight lines, each of which bears three lifts and contains six syllables.

<sup>14</sup> See Frank for an edition and Christiansen’s typescript of the poem (393, 398n3).

<sup>15</sup> “He took his teaching very seriously, and his lectures for the Faculty, especially in Old Norse, were very popular” (Ovenden 116). His published work includes an edition and translation into modern English of the *Hervarar saga ok Heiðreks* (13th century) entitled *The Saga of King Heidrek the Wise* (1960) and the article “The Battle of the Goths and the Huns” (1957), which proposes a single historical source for the last lay of the *Hervarar saga*, the *Hlöðskviða*.

<sup>16</sup> Tolkien’s glossary, originally meant to be published with Sisam’s anthology, saw the light in 1922 under the title *A Middle English Vocabulary*. Subsequently both works were bound in a single volume as first planned though they continued to be printed separately as well.

<sup>17</sup> Many books Tolkien owned were never signed by him, the biggest number of those are the ones Stanley Revell bought at auction in Oxford in 1973. Since some had no signature, he pasted a label indicating they had belonged to Tolkien. A reproduction of the sticker can be found at: <https://wayneandchristina.wordpress.com/2018/05/05/from-tolkiens-library/>.

<sup>18</sup> It also contains an offprint of J. E. Turville-Petre, “Studies on the *Ormulum* MS” [1947] (Fols. 69-84). The materials are stored at Special Collections of the Weston Library, Bodleian Libraries (University of Oxford).

<sup>19</sup> The *Ormulum* was of compulsory study during Tolkien’s undergraduate years (Cilli, *Tolkien’s* 205-06). We also know Tolkien borrowed Sweet’s second edition [1891] from Exeter College library in 1913 and 1920 (281), and that he owned three offprints of articles treating different aspects of the *Ormulum* (See 36, 220, 296).

<sup>20</sup> Tolkien’s D. Phil. student Burchfield would have been an excellent candidate to prepare a new edition, but his work on the *Ormulum* was discontinued after he began working as a lexicographer in 1957. The Early English Text Society accepted Burchfield’s offer of an edition of the work on 19 March 1957 (Scull and Hammond, *Chronology* 531), though it never materialized. Years later,



---

his research was resumed but the outcome was two more papers on the *Ormulum* (see Burchfield “*Ormulum*” 94-111 and “Line-End” 182-87).

### Works Cited

- Anderson, Douglas A. “Library, Personal.” *J. R. R. Tolkien Encyclopedia: Scholarship and Critical Assessment*, edited by Michael D. C. Drout, Routledge, 2007, pp. 361-62.
- Bowers, John M. *Tolkien’s Lost Chaucer*, Oxford UP, 2019.
- Burchfield, R. W. “Line-End Hyphens in the *Ormulum* Manuscript (MS Junius 1).” *From Anglo-Saxon to Early Modern English: Studies Presented to E. G. Stanley*, edited by Malcolm Godden et al., Clarendon Press, 1994, pp. 182-87.
- . “*Ormulum*: Words Copied by Jan van Vliet from Parts Now Lost.” *English and Medieval Studies Presented to J. R. R. Tolkien on the Occasion of his Seventieth Birthday*, edited by Norman Davis and C. L. Wrenn, Allen and Unwin, 1962, pp. 94-111.
- Cilli, Oronzo. “Addenda by Date.” *Tolkien’s Library*. 27 Sept. 2019. [tolkienslibrary.blogspot.com/p/addenda-by-date.html](http://tolkienslibrary.blogspot.com/p/addenda-by-date.html). Accessed 16 Mar. 2021.
- . “The Leaves Were Long, the Cover Was Green: A Reply to Christina Scull and Wayne G. Hammond.” *Tolkien’s Library*, 2019. [www.tolkienslibrary.blogspot.com](http://www.tolkienslibrary.blogspot.com). Accessed 19 Mar. 2021.
- . *Tolkien’s Library: An Annotated Checklist*, Luna Press Publishing, 2019.
- Cossio, Andoni. Review of *Tolkien’s Library: An Annotated Checklist*, by Oronzo Cilli. *Mythlore: A Journal of J. R. R. Tolkien, C. S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature*, vol. 38, no. 2, article 17, 2020, pp. 195-204. [dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol38/iss2/17](http://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol38/iss2/17). Accessed 25 Mar. 2021.
- Croft, Janet Brennan. Review of *Tolkien’s Library: An Annotated Checklist*, by Oronzo Cilli. *Tolkien Studies*, vol. 17, 2020, pp. 203-08. doi:10.1353/tks.2020.0010.

- 
- Eden, Bradford Lee. Review of *Tolkien's Library: An Annotated Checklist*, by Oronzo Cilli. *Journal of Inkling Studies*, vol. 10, issue 1, 2020, pp. 79-81. doi:10.3366/ink.2020.0066.
- Frank, Roberta. "Dróttkvætt." *New Literary History*, vol. 50, no. 3, 2019, pp. 393-98. doi:10.1353/nlh.2019.0031.
- Hammond, Wayne G. and Douglas A. Anderson. *J. R. R. Tolkien: A Descriptive Bibliography*, Oak Knoll Books, 1993.
- Neidorf, Leonard. "J. R. R. Tolkien's *The Fall of Arthur*: Creation from Literary Criticism." *Tolkien Studies*, vol. 14, 2017, pp. 91-113. doi:10.1353/tks.2017.0008.
- . *The Transmission of Beowulf: Language, Culture, and Scribal Behavior*, Cornell University Press, 2017.
- Ovenden, Richard. "Christopher Reuel TOLKIEN (Fellow 1964-1975)." *New College Record*, 2020, pp. 116-17.
- Pascual, Rafael J. "Manners makyth man: Christopher Tolkien medievalista." *Estel*, vol. 93, 2020, pp. 12-15.
- . Personal interview. 15-16 May 2020.
- Price, Derek J. Preface. *The Equatorie of the Planetis: Edited from Peterhouse MS. 75. I*, edited by Derek J. Price and R. M. Wilson, Cambridge UP, 1955, pp. xiii-xvi.
- Rand, Kari Anne. "The Authorship of *The Equatorie of the Planetis* Revisited." *Studia Neophilologica*, vol. 87, 2015, pp. 15-35. doi:10.1080/00393274.2014.982355.
- Ratcliff, John D. *The History of The Hobbit*, revised and expanded one volume ed., Harper Collins Publishers, 2011.
- Scull, Christina and Wayne G. Hammond. Review of *Tolkien's Library: An Annotated Checklist*, by Oronzo Cilli. *Journal of Tolkien Research*, vol. 7, issue 1, article

- 
- 10, 2019, pp. 1-6. scholar.valpo.edu/journaloftolkienresearch/vol7/iss1/10. Accessed 25 Mar. 2021.
- . *The Tolkien Companion and Guide: Chronology*, revised and expanded ed., Harper Collins Publishers, 2017.
- . *The Tolkien Companion and Guide: Reader's Guide, Part II*, revised and expanded ed., Harper Collins Publishers, 2017.
- Shippey, Tom. "Cruces in Medieval Literature." *J. R. R. Tolkien Encyclopedia: Scholarship and Critical Assessment*, edited by Michael D. C. Drout, Routledge, 2007, p. 111.
- . "Light-Elves, Dark-Elves, and Others: Tolkien's Elvish Problem." *Tolkien Studies*, vol. 1, 2004, pp. 1-15. doi:10.1353/tks.2004.0015.
- Sisam, Kenneth, ed. "Robert Mannyng of Brunne's *Handlyng Synne*." *Fourteenth Century Verse & Prose*, Clarendon Press, 1921, pp. 1-12.
- Sweet, Henry, ed. *First Middle English Primer: Extracts from the Ancren Riwe and Ormulum with Grammar, Notes, and Glossary*, 2nd ed., Clarendon Press, 1891.
- Tolkien, J. R. R. *The Letters of J. R. R. Tolkien*, edited by Humphrey Carpenter with the assistance of Christopher Tolkien, Houghton Mifflin, 2000.
- . "Philology: General Works." *The Year's Work in English Studies*, vol. 5, 1926, pp. 26-65.
- , ed. "*The Reeve's Tale*: Version Prepared for Recitation at the 'Summer Diversions' Oxford: 1939." *Tolkien Studies*, vol. 5, 2008, pp. 173-83. doi: 10.1353/tks.0.0014.
- , trans. *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight, Pearl and Sir Orfeo*, edited by Christopher Tolkien, Ballantine Books, 1980.
- . "Some Contributions to Middle-English Lexicography." *The Review of English*

---

*Studies*, vol. 1, no. 2, 1925, pp. 210-15.

Tolkien, J. R. R and E. V. Gordon, eds. *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight*, Clarendon Press, 1963.

Tolkien, J. R. R and Carl F. Hostetter, eds. “*Sir Orfeo: A Middle English Version by J. R. R. Tolkien.*” *Tolkien Studies*, vol. 1, 2004, pp. 85-123. doi:10.1353/tks.2004.0010.

Unwin, Rayner. “Publishing Tolkien.” *Mythlore: A Journal of J. R. R. Tolkien, C. S. Lewis, Charles Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature*, vol. 21, no. 2, article 7, 1996, pp. 26-29. [dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol21/iss2/7/](http://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol21/iss2/7/). Accessed 27 Mar. 2021.