

ZÁRATE, SOLEDAD. CAPTIONING AND SUBTITLING FOR D/DEAF AND HARD OF HEARING AUDIENCES. LONDON, UCL PRESS, 2021, 154 PP., 978-1-78735-712-9.

Clearly stated in its very title, this book focuses on the well-established practice of *Captioning and Subtitling for the d/Deaf and Hard of Hearing Audiences*, abbreviated as SDH and alternatively termed closed captioning. This book is the result of many years' work by Soledad Zárate, a captioner, researcher and lecturer in the field of audiovisual translation (AVT). As an area of expertise usually framed within media accessibility (MA) and AVT, SDH has become a prolific field of study, although its practice is a relatively recent phenomenon, having emerged in the US and Europe between the late 1970s and the 1990s. In terms of research, it began to gain recognition in the late 20th and early 21st centuries. Research has traditionally focused on issues such as characteristics of SDH as a practice, user reception, audience preferences, eye-tracking, young audiences, quantity and quality of captioned content, multilingualism, written language acquisition, and proposals for guidelines (see Arnáiz, 2012; Miquel-Iriarte, 2014; Neves, 2005; Romero-Fresco, 2015; Szarkowska, 2020; Zárate, 2014). More recent works have also covered a variety of other topics, such as immersive environments, subtitles through automatic speech recognition and creative subtitles (see Agulló & Matamala, 2019; Romero-Fresco & Fresno, 2023; Sala, 2022).

This book provides an overview of SDH, covering topics such as the history of SDH and deafness, and offers practical solutions for the creation of closed captions for different audiences and different types of broadcasts. Zárate's experience and expertise allow her to combine research, practice and theory, while taking stock of the sociological and market implications of this practice, in a singular way that makes this a unique contribution to AVT and MA studies. In this way, she is able to position herself critically and does so with an awareness and understanding of both the strengths and weaknesses of her own points of view. Indeed, in the preface she acknowledges her own hearing condition and thus explains that she cannot rely on her intuitions or first-hand experience when making choices while subtitling. She also states that her position draws on a social model of disability (see Palacios, 2008 for a deep understanding of this model). These two clarifications are perfectly aligned with researchers' growing awareness of their own positions and their need to show accountability. In this spirit, the author expresses her opinions, positions herself towards certain recommendations from guidelines and standards, and discusses the topics from her own perspective and experience.

The book is divided into six chapters. Chapter 1 offers a general approach to SDH and presents a refreshing perspective on the history of subtitling. Throughout the chapter, Zárate acknowledges the progress that has been made in the field, yet also raises some concerns as to a number of steps that are not currently being taken, such as the untapped potential of digital technologies (p. 8). In this chapter, and indeed throughout the book, she focuses primarily on the UK but also reviews the role of SDH in other European countries, as well as in the US and Canada. One of the most salient characteristics of the chapter is the well-defined way in which Zárate links the history of SDH with industry practices in cinemas and existing software. Chapter 2 goes on to offer a detailed review of deafness, models of deafness and disabilities, hearing devices, and methods of communication.

Chapter 3 provides a concise review of linguistic considerations in the field, after which Chapter 4 presents a summary of the technical aspects of SDH. In these two chapters, Zárate considers different audiences and media when addressing the issue of text editing, synchronisation, orthotypographical conventions and segmentation, among other parameters. In my opinion, these chapters are clear and an easy to follow for specialists that seek a detailed account of SDH as a professional practice. SDH practitioners will herein find a variety of highly relevant linguistic and technical recommendations, and I found section 4.7 on formats of SDH particularly useful. Indeed, many other research literature on SDH often lack such information, probably due to the fact that those of us researching on SDH do not always have extensive knowledge of or exposure to the innerworkings of the industry and operate within an exclusively academic context. In both Chapter 3 and Chapter 4, readers from outside the UK or those who work with languages other than English would perhaps have appreciated an explanation as to how the conventions and guidelines discussed in these chapters might be applicable to other languages and settings. Moreover, a brief review of non-conventional practices currently being implemented or researched, such as SDH in immersive environments and creative, unconventional or free-form subtitles (see Agulló & Matamala, 2019; Sala, 2022), would also have been a welcome addition to these chapters.

Chapter 5 focuses on the specific requirements of SDH, such as the captioning of paralinguistic features, speaker identification, and music, among other issues. A notably enlightening section in this chapter is in the discussions on music and silence, but a further instructive aspect of this chapter is the fact that Zárate addresses other senses that might be involved in making audiovisual products accessible for the deaf (e.g., touch). Although this chapter focuses mainly on practices in the UK, the concepts covered here can be readily extrapolated to other countries and language communities. As

a reader, I value Zárate's willingness to explain her own position as a practitioner. She provides her expert opinion on practical SDH, which is both appealing and inspiring for those who read this academic monograph.

Chapter 6 delves into live captioning, mainly for theatre performances. The author discusses some innovative solutions such as open captioning, caption glasses, automatic captioning, captioning through mobile devices, and other initiatives for live captioning. The chapter focuses on Zárate's own experience as a captioner for a puppet theatre. She discusses practices such as creative captioning and icons, live cueing, the use of software not designed for captioning (such as PowerPoint), as well as tasks and timing that need to be undertaken before, during, and after captioning. The chapter engages with the feedback the author collected over the years at the puppet shows for which she created and displayed the captions. The analysis of the data serves to improve her own SDH practice and research. As a scholar, I found section 6.3, on how to reach and engage audiences, of particular relevance. Zárate stresses the importance of having a good marketing strategy and announcing accessibility and inclusion measures before each performance. She also raises concerns that some accessible events are not always attended by deaf viewers, an issue that has already been pointed out by other practitioners (Willmington, 2017, for example). This is an underestimated problem that is not addressed sufficiently by the industry and which calls for further examination. Lastly, I warmly welcomed the author's distinction between *accessibility* and *inclusion* and the continuing social need to sensitise hearing audiences to the fact that accessibility and inclusion remain a pressing concern for all.

All of the chapters in this book end with discussion points that I found interesting and stimulating. Readers who aim to improve their captioning practice or their very understanding of SDH will find useful discussions alongside some practical exercises or points for discussion and reflection. The reader is thus invited to reflect on SDH and to take action, with many sections including external links to videos and practical exercises. The book also contains several appendices, including a questionnaire, the feedback collected during the puppet shows, and an example of a subtitle template for a clip from *School of Rock*, all of which have great potential for researchers and practitioners alike.

Unlike many other publications in the field of AVT, this monograph solely focuses on SDH. Even when the author discusses topics such as the history of subtitles, she always focuses her attention on SDH, rather than the traditional approach of using interlingual subtitles for hearers as a starting point to explain the advent and evolution of SDH. Moreover, the book's contents do not solely stem from theoretical and academic discussions;

instead, Zárate uses scholarship to work towards a better understanding of the practice. It is therefore a refreshing read that provides practical examples and stimulates critical thinking.

Published in 2021, the book naturally omits some important developments from more recent years, among which are the increased accuracy rates of automatic speech recognition for intralingual live subtitling (at least in Spanish and English, e.g., see Romero-Fresco and Fresno, 2023), legislation including video-on-demand platforms (for example, the 13/2022 Law in Spain on Audiovisual Communication), and the availability of artificial intelligence for users. Nevertheless, the author is keenly aware of the uncertain future of a rapidly changing industry such as AVT (p. 19) and unequivocally acknowledges that everything she has written in her book is likely to change in the near future.

In sum, this is an excellent contribution to AVT and MA literature. SDH specialists, or those wishing to embark on specialised courses in SDH, will find this book very useful. Readers should be aware that basic subtitling concepts (such as subtitling speed or segmentation) are not fully explained, thereby allowing expert readers to focus on the most specialised and highly technical aspects of SDH. As the author herself notes, “this book will appeal to anyone with an interest in captioning” and “is intended to act as a companion for subtitlers and captioners” (p. XIX). This book is therefore far from an introduction to subtitling, and I remind readers that there are many other publications that meet that need (e.g. De Linde & Kay, 1999; Díaz-Cintas & Ivarsson & Carroll, 1998; Remael, 2021). Be advised that this book goes directly to the main points of SDH and delves into some of the most salient topics of this AVT practice, such as verbatim vs. edited subtitles, music, audiences, etc. Zárate is both an experienced SDH practitioner and a skilled researcher, and she visibly excels at combining both roles in this monograph.

REFERENCES

- Agulló, B., & Matamala, A. (2019). Subtitling for the deaf and hard-of-hearing in immersive environments: Results from a focus group. *The Journal of Specialised Translation*, 32, 217-235.
- Arnáiz, V. (2012). Los parámetros que identifican el subtitulado para sordos: Análisis y clasificación. *MonTI. Monografías de Traducción e Interpretación*, 4, 103–132. <https://doi.org/10.6035/MonTI.2012.4.5>
- De Linde, Z., & Kay, N. (1999). *The Semiotics of Subtitling*. St Jerome.
- Díaz-Cintas, J., & Remael, A. (2021). *Subtitling: Concepts and practices*. Routledge.

- Ivarsson, J., & Carroll, M. (1998). Subtitling. TransEdit.
- Ley 13/2022, de 7 de julio, General de Comunicación Audiovisual., 13/2022 Boletín Oficial de Estado, 163, de 8 de julio de 2022. <https://www.boe.es/eli/es/l/2022/07/07/13/con>
- Miquel-Iriarte, M. (2017). The reception of subtitling for the deaf and hard of hearing: Viewers' hearing and communication profile & subtitling speed of exposure. [Doctoral dissertation, Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona].
- Neves, J. (2005). Audiovisual translation: Subtitling for the deaf and hard-of-hearing. [Doctoral dissertation, University of Roehampton].
- Palacios, A. (2008). El modelo social de discapacidad: Orígenes, caracterización y plasmación en la Convención Internacional sobre los derechos de las personas con discapacidad. Cinca.
- Romero-Fresco, P. (Ed.). (2015). The reception of subtitles for the deaf and hard of hearing in Europe. Peter Lang.
- Romero-Fresco, P., & Fresno, N. (2023). The accuracy of automatic and human live captions in English. *Linguistica Antverpiensia, New Series: Themes in Translation Studies*, 22, 114–133. <https://doi.org/10.52034/lans-tts.v22i.774>
- Sala, È. (2022). Rendering tone and mood in creative subtitles for deaf and hard-of-hearing: A proposal. *Między Oryginałem a Przekładem*, 28(1 (55)), 73–91. <https://doi.org/10.12797/MOaP.28.2022.55.04>
- Szarkowska, A. (2020). Subtitling for the deaf and the hard of hearing. In Ł. Bogucki & M. Deckert (Eds.), *The Palgrave Handbook of Audiovisual Translation and Media Accessibility* (pp. 249–268). Springer International Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-42105-2_13
- Wilmington, A. (2017). Deaf like me. Engaging 'hard to reach' deaf audiences through theatre. Red Earth Theatre.
- Zárate, S. (2014). Subtitling for deaf children: Granting accessibility to audiovisual programmes in an educational way. [Doctoral dissertation, University College London].

[ANA TAMAYO]