Exploring the Identity and the Multilingual Repertoire of Basque Primary Students in the European Framework

Eider Saragueta and Oihana Leonet

Saragueta, E., & Leonet, O. (2024). Exploring the Identity and the Multilingual Repertoire of Basque Primary Students in the European Framework. Multilingualism and Multiculturalism: Language Teaching and Learning, 3, 214.

1 Introduction: Multilingualism in Europe

Today, although there are 24 official languages in the European Union, there are also 60 indigenous, regional or minority languages. Furthermore, 40 million people speak these languages which include Basque, Catalan, Frisian, Sámi, Yiddish and Welsh. The government of each nation decides on the legal sta-tus of these languages and to what extent it should be safeguarded (European Parliament, 2016).

The Basque Country's language ecology is a dynamic field that studies the complex interactions among its diverse languages. Basque, a unique non-Indo- European language, coexists with Spanish and, to a lesser extent, French, cre- ating a linguistic tapestry shaped by historical, sociopolitical, and cultural factors. Researchers have shown a particular interest in the survival and revi- talization of Basque. Bastardas-Boada (2017) explores the language ecology, delving into the intricate relationship between languages and their natural, social, and cultural environments. Several authors, including Azurmendi et al. (2001), Arzoz (2015), and Azurmendi-Ayerbe (2018), have explored the impact of language policies on the preservation of the Basque language. They have also investigated the social responsibility of stakeholders, identifying these factors as crucial elements for the well-being of the language. This highlights the necessity for the Basque community to consider strategies promoting the sustainability of the Basque language, including the ongoing commitment and effort required from present and future generations of Basque speakers.

Globalization is a key issue to understand language ecology. These phenom-ena have emerged new identities and the concepts of "complexity" and "flex-ibility" have been enhanced (Creese and Blacklege, 2015; Norton, 2013). The concept of identity is intertwined with language teaching; according to Lasan and Rehner (2018), teaching a second or a third language, including a minority language, takes part in the formation of identity. This research enriches the understanding of the identities of Basque primary students and their attitude

towards multilingualism and the Basque language, providing an

innovative perspective. Conducted as part of a Pedagogical Translanguaging project, the study encompasses various practices, including the development of metalin- guistic awareness across languages, the use of students' entire linguistic reper- toire, and the integration of the languages in the curricula (Cenoz and Gorter, 2021). In the context of the Basque Country, Cenoz and Gorter (2017) advocate for sustainable translanguaging, considering language imbalances while pro- tecting and promoting the minority language. This study specifically examines the pedagogical practices related to sustainable translanguaging integrated into the project.

1.1 Navigating Multilingual Realities: Language Choices and Shaping Identities

Not all multilinguals have the opportunity to use, on a daily basis, the lan- guages they speak. This is the case for multilinguals living in a monolingual environment. However, in communities where two or more languages coexist, multilinguals can navigate between languages to communicate effectively in their daily tasks. Therefore, as Baker (2011) points out, these individuals make a "language choice". An essential factor in language choice is the multilingual's understanding of their interlocutor's language proficiency. Usually, the lan- guage that the two speakers shared will be used in the conversation. If both individuals are bilingual, they could switch languages at any moment during the conversation, even though changing habits can be a challenging process (Baker, 2011). García (2010) argues that language choice always involves nego-tiation in interaction. Indeed, language resources can provide or deny access to important social networks. In this way multilingual speakers: "decide who they want to be and choose their language practices accordingly" (García, 2010, p. 524). However, Cresee et al. (2006) add that not all language resources are available for all speakers in the same way and at each moment.

As experts (Cargile et al., 1994; Gardner, 1985; Gardner and MacIntyre, 1993) have noticed language attitude is one of the factors that determine language learning. An attitude is a hypothetical construct and is used to explain the direction and durability of people's behaviour (Baker, 2011). Ajzen (1988) defines attitude thus: "as a disposition to respond favourably or unfa- vourably to an object, person, institution or event" (Ajzen, 1988, p. 4). That is why attitudes can be an evaluating reaction with respect to an object, i.e., with respect to the act of learning a language. Furthermore, attitude can be expected to be linked to motivation and achievements when learning a second language. According to Gardner's model, the mastery of a second language can be clearly predicted through motivation involving three agents: the will

to learn a language, attitudes, and the effort made in learning the

language (Gardner, 1985).

Besides being a social practice, language has to be explored in a broad socio-political environment because it exerts an influence on the individual's identity, on the decision-making processes and on the language choice (Cavanaugh, 2020). Language ideology is almost inseparable from language attitude, indeed, language ideology is directly linked to the speaker's characteristics. It is defined as "the explicit evaluation of particular languages and language varieties, expressed by people as opinions and beliefs and, more neg- atively, as prejudices. They influence people's thought processes and specific language choices" (Doowy-Rybiska and Hornsby 2021, p. 106). Moreover, language attitude and language ideology exert an influence on language teaching, indeed, they can help or hinder integration; for that reason, they can deter- mine the teaching of minority languages (Rosiak, 2022).

Due to globalization, there has been a rise in intercultural relations, both on individual and societal levels, propelled by migration and technological advancements (Beinhoff and Rasinger, 2016). Languages play a key role in the dynamics of this movement (Kroskrity, 2000). In recent years, the global increase in cultural and linguistic diversity, driven by migration and transnational diasporas, has reshaped relationships and led to the emergence of new linguistic identities. In this context, Hernandez (2008, pp. 31–32) observes:

> Among us, multiple element identities have also become a model, firstly because society itself has become more complex; secondly, because the individual him-/herself, his/her interests, wishes and experiences have expanded. Language contact, culture contact and relations between peo- ple (real as well as virtual) are features of today's developed societies.

Research has progressively uncovered the complexities of contemporary iden- tity issues, as noted by Preece (2016), with a shift in applied linguistics from perceiving identity as fixed characteristics to understanding it as a social con- struct. Azurmendi (2017, p. 75), reminds us that 'a language is a community, not a grammar and a dictionary.' This transformation highlights the complex issue of identity. Similarly, Block (2007) emphasised that social sciences perceive identity as fluid and multidimensional.

According to Baker (2011), identity encompasses gender, class, race, ethnicity, age, religion, culture, etc., and is socially constructed. This perspective embraces identity as diverse, complex, environment-driven, layered, occasion- ally fragmented, contradictory, and context-dependent. Therefore, identities continually evolve with time, situation, and interactions, reflecting a dynamic

and adaptive process, meaning that they are fluid, dynamic and diverse

(Creese and Blackledge, 2015). As for Norton (2013), identities are constantly chang- ing shape because they are influenced by experience and interaction. Some individuals primarily define themselves based on the language they speak. For instance, "speaking in Basque or Catalan language is typically an important boundary marker" (Baker, 2011, p. 398). Thus, in these cases, language is the essential element in identity formation. In contrast, for Celtic people generally, speaking Gaelic or Irish is not essential to feel Scottish or Irish because other features besides language contribute to identity. Otherwise, 99% of Scottish citizens would not identify as Scottish, as they do not speak Gaelic (Baker, 2011). Identity has to be examined in a nuanced way as "simple labels hide com- plex realities" (Romaine, 2014, p. 447). In the same vein, Azurmendi et al. (2008) assert that the configuration of national identification, Basqueness, or Basque identity is complex. Numerous characteristics come to the surface, including language, national cultural feeling, and territoriality – all of which are inher- ently complex, "particularly with respect to language and culture, which can-

not be disassociated from bilingualism" (Azurmendi et al., 2008, p. 47).

Language is linked to culture, and Basque speakers, who are also fluent in French and/or Spanish, embody this link and multilingualism becomes an element of their cultural identity.

2 Identity, Education and Language

Language acquisition is linked to identity formation just as the identity of the individual influences language acquisition. It can be said that the relation- ship is two-way. Other dimensions such as gender, socioeconomic status, race and ethnicity influence in the identity formation as well (Pavlenko, 2002). Speakers' or Writers' values are reflected through complex social or cultural practices, which are negotiated by means of power relationships that are in flux (De Costa et al., 2016).

Therefore, education is an important agent in identity building. Language, culture and knowledge are socially constructed, but they are not definitively settled. Students and teachers can give value to a minoritized language by using it to acquire knowledge at different educational stages. In addition, knowledge can be built through bilingual education where students can learn at least one other language and culture (Evans, 2018). Thus, in multilingual contexts such as the Basque Country, where the minoritized language is the main language of instruction in compulsory education, multilingual students develop com- plex identities. In a study carried out with Basque elementary school students,

Saragueta et al., (2022) concluded that the process of language learning at school, the situation of the minority language and the identity of the students concur in a complex reality.

Identity plays a central role in language learning, challenging the notion of fixed dichotomies or isolated learners. Norton (2013) emphasizes that social power affects interactions, arguing that learners' identities are dynamic, diverse, and subject to change. She sees social identity as a dynamic site of struggle, where individuals can challenge and reshape their social positions over time.

Lasan and Rehner (2018) observed that engaging with the target language during (extra)curricular activities has a significant impact on learners' profi- ciency in understanding and expressing themselves in a second language (L2). Preliminary analysis categorized learners into three groups: those skilled in both perceiving and expressing identity and intentions, those capable only of perceiving, and those unable to do either. The study unveiled a positive cor- relation between self-reported language abilities and increased exposure to (extra)curricular L2 activities. Acquiring sociolinguistic competence, which involves the proper use and interpretation of sociolinguistic varieties, poses a challenge for L2 learners. Some expressed confidence in their receptive abili- ties but not in their productive ones, while others felt confident in both aspects. Exposure to the target language enhances learners' proficiency in perceiving and expressing identity and intentions in L2. Additionally, it underscores the challenges faced by L2 learners in attaining sociolinguistic competence.

Creese et al. (2015) stress the importance of school in the development of the identity. In their view, the link between the two is significant in to under- stand the formation and development of identity. The reflection of many imbalances that occur in the society is seen at school since students from minority communities are often perceived as a minority at school. Numerous events taking place at school determine the formation of identity to a certain extent, and what language teachers transmit should also be taken into consid- eration because they are agents in identity negotiations as well (Pavlenko and Blackledge, 2004).

As Saragueta et al. (2022) shows in their study, multilingual primary school students show complex identities where there is a minority language. In that case, a third of the students had (a) different language(s) at home than at school. This means that the process of learning languages at school, the sit- uation of the minority language and the identity of the students concur in a complex reality.

Language, culture and knowledge are built socially, but they are not definitively finished products. Students and teachers can attach value to a

minoritized language by using it to acquire knowledge throughout the whole education system. At the same time, knowledge can be built through bilingual education because the students are open to getting to know at least one other language and culture (Evans, 2018).

3 Pedagogical Translanguaging: Embracing Students Multilingual Repertoire

In recent years, translanguaging has emerged as a dynamic and multifaceted concept, encompassing various dimensions of multilingual communication. This section delves into exploring its trajectory, emphasizing pedagogical translanguaging (Cenoz and Gorter, 2021). Taking contributions from different perspectives, we can say that translanguaging has expanded in two main direc- tions: firstly, two or more languages in the same space and time are referred to as activities or sets of activities taking place systematically and with a didactic aim (Cenoz and Gorter, 2021; Lewis et al., 2012). Secondly, to refer to the languaging of multilingual speakers and is used in the classroom (García and Wei, 2014), breaking away from static language constructs (e.g., Blommaert, 2010; Makoni and Pennycook, 2005; Otheguy, et al., 2015). Essentially, both of them consider the entire repertoire of multilinguals, with the goal of overcoming the barriers established between 'languages'. Some research and didactical con- tributions to the pedagogical use of translanguage are closer to the proposal initially made in Wales, while others are closer to the nonstructuralist position (Leung and Valdes, 2019).

Through translanguaging, Cenoz and Gorter (2001) stress the need for a holistic perspective in language research and teaching and propose to take into consideration the following three dimensions: the specific characteris- tics of the multilingual speaker, his/her complete linguistic repertoire, and the social context in which the languages are used (see also Cenoz and Gorter, 2014). Therefore, Cenoz and Gorter (2014) highlight the social dimension of the multilingual construct in addition to the linguistic and psycholinguistic dimensions. Moreover, these authors stress the need to do more from the monolingual practices still rooted in multilingual education, the integration of the languages in the curricula and giving students the opportunity to use their full linguistic repertoire.

Most of the research conducted into translanguaging has focussed on English-speaking countries where an additional language is involved in edu- cation (Creese and Blackledge, 2010; García, 2009; Gort and Sembiante, 2015; Martin-Beltrán, 2014). Although they are minority languages in these places,

they have status and a large number of speakers in their countries of origin. By way of example, we can cite Spanish, Punjabi or Mandarin in the USA and the UK. In contrast, regional minority languages are only spoken in particu- lar regions and are not the mainstream languages in any nation state (Extra and Gorter, 2008). Therefore, examined from a demographic, geographical and functional perspective, they are much weaker than the above-mentioned lan- guages; in most cases, their survival is not guaranteed. In educational contexts with regional minority languages, Cenoz et al. (2017) proposed a sustainable translanguaging. Leonet et al. (2017) reports a pedagogical intervention based on translanguaging, which aims at developing communicative and academic competences in Basque, Spanish, and English. They found that translanguaging can be compatible with the maintenance and development of a minority lan- guage under certain conditions. They advocate for sustainable translanguaging taking into account the wider social context of the school, allowing spaces for the minority languages and by giving full support to the Basque language.

4 Research Questions

In the review of the literature, we have seen that language attitudes and language identity are essential elements since they influence the language learning process. Taking the findings presented into account, the research questions are:

1. What are Basque primary school students' attitudes towards the minority language?
2. How do Basque primary school students show their identity in the classroom?

5 Method

Ethnography, specifically ethnography inside the classroom, served as the methodological backbone for this study, offering a unique lens into the sub- jective experiences in education (Morton, 2013). The person undertaking eth- nography wishes to understand the subjective experiences of others and s/he has to be open to what is happening. Furthermore, it reveals the complexities that may exist in education and that is why it is necessary to display empathy as well as to be open in terms of methodology and approach (Pérez-Izaguirre et al., 2022). Ethnography, is viewed as an experience or a process before becoming a written text (Agar, 1980; Hughes et al., 1992; Creese et al., 2017), in

which the researcher, engage in a methodical process of producing a descrip- tion of a specific group (Creese et al., 2017). In a similar vein, Duranti (2000) outlines ethnography's initial approach, involving a written description of the social organization of a group, its actions, symbolic resources, and participa- tory engagement over an extended period of time.

Given the centrality of languages in our research, we engage in linguistic anthropology, viewing linguistic ethnography as an interpretative approach. In the view of Copland et al. (2015), linguistic ethnography is an interpretative approach, and explores events occurring locally and spontaneously. Always from the perspective of the person or persons who have been involved in these events, although it has to be borne in mind that these interactions are rooted in the public context and structures (Creese and Copland, 2017). Heller (2009) emphasizes how ethnography allows us to explore language practices' con- nections to people's real-life conditions, uncovering stories that might remain undiscovered:

> They [ethnographies] allow us to see how language practices are con- nected to the very real conditions of people's lives, to discover how and why language matters to people in their own terms, and to watch pro- cesses unfold over time. They allow us to see complexity and connec- tions, to understand the history and geography of language. They allow us to tell a story; not someone else's story exactly but our own story of some slice of experience, a story which illuminates social processes and generates explanations for why people do and think the things they do. (Heller, 2009, p.250).

Therefore, ethnography is helpful in bringing to light many stories that remained in the dark. Likewise, as traditions are rooted in us, it is difficult to think outside our frame of reference, and that is why the way we think and act often predominates (Greene,2013).

As we have seen, ethnographies can be undertaken in any social space, and in education, too. The ethnography done in education is known as "classroom ethnography" and in this research study, it has been referred to as ethnography inside the classroom.

In the educational realm, ethnography takes the form of "classroom ethnog- raphy," emphasized in this study as ethnography inside the classroom. Over the past 25 years, this approach has evolved, stressing the sociocultural aspects of learning and teaching processes (Grenfell, 2012). Navigating the infinite complexities of the classroom as Bloomeet al. (2018) point out, classroom eth- nography seeks a holistic view to understand in depth the social and cultural

interactions taking place in the classroom and to understand how the participants reflect social and historical events.

Despite attempts to avoid influencing the research subject by adopting an attitude as subtle as possible during ethnography, Heller (2011) argues that complete objectivity is unattainable and that this is not the goal of the method. Heller posits that the active presence of the researcher is essential in data col- lection, recognizing his or her inevitable influence on the data collected. In this study, learners were transparently informed of the researcher's interest in language and culture, in line with previous research (Jones et al., 2000).

6 Pedagogical Intervention and the School

The ethnography was developed as part of an intervention based on peda- gogical translanguaging (Cenoz and Gorter, 2021) to enhance learners' com- municative competence in three languages and improve their linguistic and metalinguistic awareness.

The project was implemented in a public school within the Basque Auto- nomous Community, situated in an industrial area, and attended by students from a low-middle socioeconomic background. The school, hosting over 600 students and 60 teachers, is organized into pre-primary and primary education levels. It follows the Amara Berri system, a distinctive pedagogical approach characterized by its unique features, and it is part of a network comprising nineteen schools (for an overview, see Anaut, 2004). The school has the D education model, where Basque serves as the language of instruction, while Spanish and English are taught as subjects. The intervention lasted 4 months, from February to May. The didactic materials were created specifically for this intervention taking into account a comprehensive analysis of previous experi- ences abroad and the school's own methodology.

The school in the research is an Amara Berri System school and they have specific pedagogical features. For example, they work in cycles, so students in the 5th and 6th grades are together in the same classroom, which incorpo- rates distinct pedagogical features. For instance, the school operates in cycles, with 5th and 6th-grade students sharing the same classroom. This arrange- ment encourages older students to assist their younger peers, fostering a recip- rocal exchange of explanations and support, as older students can reinforce their understanding through activities with the younger ones (Arnault, 2004). Another notable feature is the division of subjects (Mathematics, Natural Sciences, Basque, Spanish, English, etc.) into four areas, each lasting approx- imately one month. This rotational system enables students to revisit each area multiple times throughout the academic year. Consequently, the tasks

assigned at the beginning and end of the academic year become progressively more challenging, as students can apply knowledge acquired in other areas. Each area focuses on specific aspects related to the main subjects, and 5th and 6th-grade students collaboratively engage in subject-specific projects. Therefore, the four Spanish areas are: documentaries, magazine and comic, video, and grammar. The names of these areas reflect the content and sub- jects they address. For example, in the documentaries area, students typically watch a documentary and complete related tasks. Similarly, in the broadcasting area, students prepare radio or TV programs, selecting a subject, drafting a script, creating or preparing necessary props, recording, and then editing the video or radio program with the guidance of the audio-visual teacher (see also Cenoz, Leonet and Saragueta, 2019). The final product is broadcasted via the school TV, offering the entire school community an opportunity to view the students' work and engage in reflective discussions. Following a month in each area, students rotate to the next one until they have cycled through all four. Importantly, students revisit each area more than once, providing an oppor- tunity to apply prior knowledge, and the complexity of the content increases with each rotation.

7 Participants

The project involved three groups, and one of them was selected for this study based on several criteria. The teacher leading this group demonstrated a highly positive attitude toward incorporating research activities in her classroom. Notably, she was the sole teacher proficient in English among her colleagues. The participants were 24 bilingual primary school students (average age = 10.67) with over half being female (56.7%) and 43.3% being male. Participants had Spanish (58.3%), Basque (25%), or Igbo, Yola, Arabic and Amazigh (16.7%) as their mother tongue, with English being their third language in most of the cases. The students were multilingual, speaking fluent Basque and Spanish and learning English. While academic instruction predominantly occurred in Basque, the students predominantly used Spanish at home with their parents, reflecting the dominant language in their immediate environment.

Data Collection and Analysis

A students' background questionnaire was developed, encompassing both individual and environmental variables. This questionnaire was distributed to all students before the intervention. The collected information included details

such as first language, gender, age, language spoken in the family, and the perception of multilingual competence. The students individually completed the initial questionnaire within a designated 15-minute period. Subsequently, the collected data were processed and coded by the researchers.

In the following section, we will describe the two activities that have been specifically designed for this research study: (1) a reflection on a video created by students in the video area and (2) the writing and reflection exercise: 'History of Basque. What do we know about Basque?'.

7.1 Reflexion about Basque Language Use

The first activity delved into the reflection on a video created by students in the Basque-language class. Students produce a radio or TV program based on the rotation schedule. For this intervention, students were tasked with creating a short video focusing on the use of Basque. They utilized situations from their everyday lives, exploring where, with whom, and when they used Basque. The objective was for students to produce a 2-minute video, and they were given approximately one month (one rotation) to specify the subject, prepare the script, record, edit, and present it to the class. After that, the classroom dynamic was to reflect on the work presented and to make constructive criticism providing an opportunity for collective reflection on the group's work.

Aligned with the pedagogical intervention, students were directed to explore topics related to Basque language use in their daily lives. After four rotations, the video topics covered were: (1) Use of the language outside school activities, (2) A grandfather discussing Basque use, (3) Language use by school students and teachers, (4) Use of the language by workers in a bazaar and their positive attitude toward Basque. Among these, the second video, featuring the Basque-speaking grandfather discussing the state of Basque, generated the most classroom discussion. This particular video will be the focus of analy- sis in this section. The researcher closely followed the production process of the video in the Basque language area, monitoring the entire month-long process with the students. To capture the reflections of students and teachers, the researcher was present during the presentation of the video at the end of the rotation.

7.2 'History of Basque. What Do We Know about Basque?'

The second activity was conducted in the Spanish class where students explored documentaries (Documentales). In this activity, students had to write what their knew about the history of the Basque language. For that, they

watched a video about the origin of the language and answered questions related to the documentary. Before watching the video, students responded to four questions, all focused in Basque language. The first question addressed the origin of Basque, while the second inquired about the language usage. In the latter question, students were asked about the world around them and the world in general, always in relation to Basque and their knowledge about the language. The third question prompted students to write about words that dif- fer in pronunciation in Basque, and the fourth required them to identify words that are similar in Basque, Spanish, and English (cognate words). The final question was: 'Historia de leuskera ¿Qué sabemos sobre el euskera?' (History of Basque. What do we know about Basque?). The researcher was present dur- ing the activity, enabling to answer directly students' doubts and arguments. Additionally, as this was an individual written task prepared for the interven- tion, the researcher collected all the students' scripts and later transcribed them for subsequent analysis.

The data and transcripts collected in the two tasks were organised using a word processor (Word). A free coding technique was then used to create codes based on the data for content classification. In addition, the observation data were documented in a field diary and the transcripts were compiled in an anal- ysis document.

8 Findings and Discussion

To address the research questions, the following section presents findings derived from the analysis of data collected through classroom ethnogra- phy. We will explore the connections between students' identity, language, and attitudes. The first research question delves into students' attitudes toward language, with a specific focus on the video produced in the Basque language class.

8.1 Language Attitudes and Basque

We will investigate the students' perceptions on the Basque language. After the month-long rotation, the entire group viewed a video entitled "The Basque- speaking grandfather discussing the Basque situation", and we will observe the resulting discussion. During the presentation day, all students sat in three rows facing the digital screen to watch the video. The teacher paused the video and asked several open-ended questions to the students in Basque language.

Teacher: Let's see, what is the Basque-speaking grandpa saying? ST7: He mentioned that he was punished for speaking Basque. Teacher: By whom? Was it by the family?

Researcher's remark: Some are shouting 'no', but afterward, all students reply is heard loud and clear: 'the school'. (IandT_bideo_Aieu_aurkez1)

The researcher notes that they are all focused on watching the video, and the students shout out their answers in unison.

To a certain extent at least, they were aware of the past situation of Basque. Somehow, they had heard the message that speaking it was forbidden and if the students spoke Basque they were punished with the ring, the "anti" (objects used for punishing children) or through some other means. As in other countries with minoritized languages, the ring served as a marker for students speaking Basque. The teacher initially handed it to the first student speaking Basque, who then passed it on to the next person they heard using Basque. At day's end, the student holding the ring faced consequences. Similarly, "anti" (anti-Basque) an object was employed in the French-speaking area, which led to similar consequences. Most of them had heard about that at home and knew that Basque was banned at school.

They appeared particularly moved by the school issue, possibly due to a per- sonal connection with the situation. As both students and the teacher shared stories, a sense of surprise permeated the group, despite their prior familiarity with such narratives. The ensuing conversation revealed that all students knew, to varying extents, about the past Basque language situation. This awareness was emphasized in the video "The Basque-speaking grandfather talking about the situation of Basque," part of the classroom's broadcast in Basque language. The teacher specifically asked about their understanding of the past Basque language situation at school, and all students affirmed prior knowledge.

ST7: He continued speaking in Basque.

Teacher: He continued speaking in Basque. Have your grandma and grandpa mentioned this to you? Specifically, those of you with Basque- speaking grandparents.

Researcher's remark: All of them raised their hands, except for students ST2, ST11, and ST12

Teacher: Look how many. (IandT_bideo_Aieu_aurkez1)

Most students in the classroom raised their hands, with three exceptions: ST2, ST11, and ST12. Despite not initially raising their hands, these students, ST2,

ST11, and ST12, listened attentively to their classmates' experiences, as they hadn't heard about the ban from their families. Notably, ST2 and ST12 likely learned about it from their parents, not from the classroom video featuring grandparents. Interestingly, ST11, who hadn't acquired this information at home, mentioned close interactions with Basque-speaking neighbours, indicating an alternative source of awareness. While the majority learned from their grandparents, in these three cases, information was obtained from a different source. It can be concluded that all students were aware of the historical ban on Basque, demonstrating varied sources of transmission.

The teacher then wanted to compare the current situation of the Basque language with what many of their grandparents had experienced in the past, to encourage reflection, she said in Basque language:

> Teacher: Look at how much things have changed; do we still punish students for speaking Basque in school?
> Everyone: No, no
> ST9: The opposite
> Teacher: The opposite.
> ST3: Congratulate
> Teacher: We congratulate them.
> (IandT_bideo_Aieu_aurkez1)

Through these reflections and comparisons, the teacher aimed to provide stu-dents with a comprehensive view – illustrating both the historical state of the language and its current status. Additionally, the evolution from teachers punishing to congratulating was highlighted.

Through the conversation, it became evident that students were aware of the historical ban on Basque and its limited use in the past at school. Presently, Basque-speaking students have the opportunity to use the language, yet not all multilinguals, according to Baker (2011), can engage in daily multilingual- ism. While speaking Basque is no longer prohibited, students are "congratulated" for doing so, reinforcing the importance of language use. The frequent request in schools to "speak in Basque please" underscores the vulnerability of minority languages, aligning with the concept of sustainable translanguaging proposed by Cenoz and Gorter (2017). Despite these challenges, the conversation revealed the potential for language and culture transmission to foster linguistic awareness.

Moreover, Rosiak (2022) emphasizes how attitudes and ideologies directly influence teaching in minority languages. The students' reflections on their attitude toward Basque and its impact on language use demonstrated this

influence. Despite increased opportunities for Basque use compared to their grandparents, students find it challenging, leading to mentions of congratulation, as if speaking Basque were exceptional.

8.2 Identities and Minority Language

The second research question pertains to the identity expressed by the students. Therefore, our focus will be on the task conducted by the students in the Spanish subject and the following discussions.

The first question presented to them in the Spanish "documentaries" section was, "What do you know about the origin of Basque?" While most responses highlighted where they use Basque, this particular student went beyond and provided an additional detail:

> It's dying out, and also that is spoken in a small part of southern France (ST10_Dc_EuJat).

The student's quote clearly indicates an understanding of the declining state of Basque. By stating that Basque is 'dying out,' the student reflects on the language, demonstrating awareness of its vulnerability. Although the student focuses on the regions where Basque is spoken, the quote does not encompass the whole of the Basque Country.

While the students were completing the task, the researcher asked ques- tions and occasionally initiated discussions. Depending on the students' level of maturity, the researcher obtained information directly through clear expressions. Despite efforts to maintain impartiality, influencing the research question is often unavoidable (Heller, 2011). Whenever feasible, the researcher engaged in reflective conversations with the students in Basque language.

> Researcher: Which languages do you consider as your own? ST1: Basque, Spanish, Galician and a bit of English
> Researcher: That's a lot! And where do you feel you are from, ST1? You say you have many languages.
> ST1: Yes, I do. Well, I feel Basque and Galician, because I have one family there and the other here, both of them, the one there and the one here. I hadn't thought about that, but it's true. That's it.
> Researcher: How interesting, ST1! May I continue? What about you ST8? ST8: Well, I'm Basque, that's it.
> Researcher: But what language do you speak? ST8: Spanish and Basque (Dc_OrigenEU_ident)

The conversation indicates that the students are multilingual, which impacts their identity formation. Evans (2018) argues that bilingual education enables knowledge acquisition, as students are receptive to discovering another language and culture. However, language, culture, and knowledge are socially constructed and never complete products. At the same time, because language is intricately linked to culture, it cannot be separated from bilingualism, and as Azurmendi et al. (2008) point out, bilingualism is a part of Basque culture, leading Basque speakers to also speak French, and/or as well as Spanish. In this example, the students show us how language influences identity formation, but at the same time student ST1 refers to the lack of reflection about that. In this instance, the researcher was taken aback by student ST1's reflection. As highlighted by Pérez-Izaguirre et al. (2022), the researcher should exhibit openness in both methodological and conceptual terms, alongside demonstrating empathy. Creese and Blackledge (2015) argue that young people spend a significant amount of time in school, influencing the development of their individual identity. However, other factors also play a role. Hernandez (2008) contends that language and culture contact, along with real and virtual inter- actions between people, are prevalent in modern society. This is exemplified in the conversation presented by ST1. As noted by Creese and Blackledge (2015), identity is fluid, dynamic, and multiple. The student who identifies herself as both Galician and Basque illustrates the negotiation of identity. De Fina (2016) similarly observes that young people negotiate their identity through speech, utilizing novel resources and strategies. De Fina (2016) similarly observes that young people negotiate their identity through their speech, utilizing novel resources and strategies.

8.3 Reflecting on Identity

The students engaged in reflecting on their identity and language usage, as exemplified below.

While the researcher was interviewing student ST11 about their opinion on his/her origin, student ST13 unexpectedly interjected. This surprised the researcher as ST13 had been predominantly reserved and introverted dur- ing class.

> Researcher: ¿De dónde te sientes? (Where do you feel you are from (ST11)?)
> ST13: Yo me siento vasca. (I feel Basque)
> (Dc_OrigenEU_ident)

As stated, ST13 was a quiet student, so when the researcher saw the simplicity of the answer, she decided to delve further into the matter and so scratched below the surface by asking:

> Researcher: eta hori da dena? Edo sentitzen zara ikerketa herrikoa? (And that's it? Or do you feel you are from Research Town?)
> ST13: Ere bai, pixka bat (That too, a bit)
> (Dc_OrigenEU_ident)

The researcher's intention was evident as the student did not mention the research town, and the aim was to determine whether there is any connection between identity and the research town. Additionally, during the conversation, the researcher's inclination towards the Basque language became apparent as she switched from Spanish to Basque and continued speaking with the stu- dents in that language. The conversation proceeded, and the researcher posed various questions, but our focus will be on what student ST13 said.

> Researcher: And what languages do you speak? Well, which ones do you know?
> ST13: I know. I speak Basque, Spanish and a bit of English. But mostly Basque and Spanish.
> Researcher: Earlier you said a bit of Research Town. ST13, do you feel European? Do you feel you belong to the world?
> ST13: Yes, the thing is I've got family in Europe.
> Researcher: But do you feel European for that reason? ST13: Because I live in Europe.
> (Dc_OrigenEU_ident)

The researcher seized the opportunity to inquire about languages, and the stu- dent clearly indicated being multilingual. However, the student specified that they spoke Basque and Spanish most proficiently. Additionally, the student's response revealed a sense of European identity. Other students who mentioned having family in Europe and feeling a connection to the European identity expressed similar sentiments. Notably, student ST9's case stood out; despite being aware of their European identity, they did not feel a sense of belong- ing. This conversation underscores the intricate interplay between language and identity, where complex realities remain concealed (Romaine, 2014).The configuration of student identity involves various elements. Interpersonal relationships have undergone a clear evolution in recent years, influencing individual habits and causing both language and identity to adapt (Hernandez, 2008). The shift from fixed features to a social construct in applied linguistics

highlights the complexity of identity (Preece, 2016). Baker (2011) emphasizes that speaking Basque or Catalan is a significant boundary marker, illustrating the intricate relationship between identity and language. Pavlenko (2002) sug- gests that language acquisition is linked to some strands of identity formation, interacting and influencing other dimensions. Language acquisition research places the concept of identity at the center of language teaching (Lasan and Rehner, 2018), and according to Creese and Blackledge (2015), the school plays a crucial role in the development of individual identity. They also argue that the identity of minority communities in society is often perceived as such in schools, reflecting imbalances present in society.

9 Conclusions

In this study, we have explored the linguistic attitudes and identities of Basque primary students, aligning with the Social Sciences trend that views identity as a fluid and multidimensional complex phenomenon (Block, 2007; Preece, 2016). Our research study demonstrates that classroom ethnography provides valuable insights into how students perceive and reflect on social and histori- cal events, as pointed out by Bloome and Beauchemin (2018).

This research study enriches the understanding the identities of Basque primary students and their attitudes towards multilingualism and the Basque minoritylanguage, offeringaninnovativeperspective. Thestudywasconducted as part of a Pedagogical Translanguaging project and it encompasses various practices, such as developing metalinguistic awareness across languages, using students' entire linguistic repertoire, and integrating the language curricula (Cenoz and Gorter, 2021). Within the Basque Country's framework, Cenoz and Gorter (2017) promote sustainable translanguaging, taking into account the language imbalance, and protecting and promoting the minority language. This research specifically examines the pedagogical practices associated with sustainable translanguaging seamlessly incorporated into the project.

The study illustrates the imbalance in Basque societal dynamics through students language awareness expressed in the classroom. The identity of minority communities in society is also perceived as a minority within the school context, as noted by Creese and Blackledge (2015). Our research study further illustrates this imbalance as students demonstrate their language awareness towards the Basque language while recognizing its vulnerability. In this context, it is crucial to consider local characteristics, especially in the case of minoritized languages. As emphasized by Cenoz and Gorter (2017), creating sustainable spaces in the classroom is essential to promote the use and knowledge of these languages.

Identity, education, and language are intricately intertwined, as noted by De Costa et al. (2016), and language teaching plays a vital role in shaping iden- tity. The concept of identity is dynamic, flexible, and encompasses fluid and multiple dimensions. While certain aspects of identity may be challenging to change, as observed in this study, such as the sense of belonging, Azurmendi (2017) emphasizes that being a member of a society does not dictate a rigid identity. As stated in our research study, individual and community identities can remain flexible. The constant creation, change, and reinvention of identity constitute an endless process.

Finally, although this study is conducted in the school context, the explora- tion of language as a social practice must extend into a broader socio-political context, influencing individual identity and language-related decision-making processes.

Disclosure Statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the authors.

Acknowledgement

This work was supported by the Basque Government [grant number: 1666-22]; and the Basque Government grant HEZKUNTZA23/13. Special thanks to the teachers and students who participated in this research study.

References

Agar, M. (1980). Stories, background knowledge and themes: Problems in the analysis of life history narrative. *American Ethnologist*, *7*(2), 223–239.

Ajzen, I. (1988). *Attitudes, Personality, and Behavior.* Milton Keynes: Open University Press.

Anaut de Gracia, L. (2004). *Sobre el Sistema Amara Berri*. Eusko Jaurlaritzaren Argital- pen Zerbitzu Nagusia = Servicio Central de Publicaciones del Gobierno Vasco.

Arzoz, X. (2015). The impact of language policy on language revitalization. In

H. Marten, M. Rießler, J. Saarikivi, and R. Toivanen (Eds.), Cultural and linguis- tic minorities in the Russian Federation and the European Union (pp. 315–334). Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-10455-3_12.

Azurmendi, J., Larrañaga, N., and Apalategi, J. (2008). Bilingualism, identity

and citizen- ship in the Basque Country. In M. Niño-Murcia and J. Rothman (Eds.), *Bilingualism and Identity: Spanish at the Crossroads with Other Languages* (pp. 35–62). John Benjamins.

Azurmendi, M. J., Bachoc, E., and Zabaleta, F. (2001). Reversing language shift: The case of Basque. In J. Fishman (Ed.), *Can Threatened Languages be Saved?: Reversing Language Shift Revisited: A 21st Century Perspective* (pp. 234–259). Multilingual Matters. https://doi.org/10.21832/9781853597060-012.

Azurmendi, J., Larrañaga, N., and Apalategi, J. (2008). Bilingualism, identity and citizen- ship in the Basque Country. In M. Niño-Murcia and J. Rothman (Eds.), *Bilingualism and Identity: Spanish at the Crossroads with Other Languages* (pp. 35–62). John Benjamins.

Azurmendi, J. (2017). *Hizkuntza, Nazioa, Estatua*. Elkar Argitaletxea.

Azurmendi-Ayerbe, M. J. (2010). Hizkuntza-ekologia eta jasangarritasuna, globalizazi- oan: euskarari begira. *Bat: Soziolinguistika aldizkaria*, (*75*), 145–163.

Baker, C. (2011). *Foundations of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism* (5th ed.). Multi- lingual Matters.

Bastardas-Boada, A. (2017). The ecology of language contact: Minority and majority languages. In A. F. Fill and H. Penz (Eds.), *The Routledge handbook of ecolinguistics* (pp. 26–39). Routledge.

Beinhoff, B., and Rasinger, S. M. (2016). The future of identity research: Impact and new developments in sociolinguistics. In S. Preece (Ed.), *The Routledge Handbook of Language and Identity* (pp. 572–585). Routledge.

Block, D. (2007). The Rise of Identity in SLA Research, Post Firth and Wagner (1997). *The Modern Language Journal*, *91*(1), 863–876.

Blommaert, J. (2010). *The sociolinguistics of globalization*. Cambridge University Press.

Bloome, D. and Beauchemin, F. (2018). Classroom Ethnography. In H. Callan (ed.), *The International Encyclopedia of Anthropology* (pp. 1–9). Wiley Online Library https:// doi.org/10.1002/9781118924396.wbiea1705.

Cargile, A. C. Giles, H., Ryan, E. B., and Bradac, J. J. (1994). Language attitudes as a social process: A conceptual model and new directions. *Language and Communication*, *14*(3), pp. 211–236.

Cavanaugh, J. (2020). Language ideology revisited. *International Journal of the Sociology of Language*, *2020*(263), pp. 51–57. https://doi.org/10.1515/ijsl-2020-2082.

Cenoz, J., and Gorter, D. (2014). Focus on Multilingualism as an Aroach in Educational Contexts. In: A. Blackledge, and A. Creese (Eds.), *Heteroglossia as Practice and Pedagogy. Educational Linguistics*, vol. 20. Springer https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-007-7856-6_13.

Cenoz, J., and Gorter, D. (2017) Minority languages and sustainable translanguaging: threat or oortunity? *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 38(10), pp. 901–912. DOI: 10.1080/01434632.2017.1284855.

Cenoz, J., Leonet, O., and Saragueta, E. (2019). Cruzando fronteras entre lenguas: una intervención didáctica. *Textos de didáctica de la lenguay laliteratura*, *84*, 33–39.

Cenoz, J., and Gorter, D. (2021). *Pedagogical Translanguaging.* Cambridge University Press.

Cenoz, J., Leonet, O., and Gorter, D. (2022). Developing cognate awareness through pedagogical translanguaging. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, *25*(8), 2759–2773.

Copland, F., and Creese, A. (Eds.), (2015). *Linguistic Ethnography: Collecting, Analysing and Presenting Data.* SAGE.

Creese, A., Bhatt, A., Bhojani, N., and Martin, P. (2006). Multicultural, heritage and learner identitiesin complementary schools. *Language and Education*, *20*, pp. 23–43. Creese, A., and Blackledge, A. (2010). Translanguaging in the bilingual classroom: A pedagogy for learning and teaching? *The Modern Language Journal*, *94*(1), pp. 103–115.

Creese, A., and Blackledge, A. (2015). Translanguaging and identity in educational set- tings. *Annual Review of Alied Linguistics*, *35*, pp. 20–35.

Creese, A., and Copland, F. (2017). Linguistic ethnography. In K. A. King, Y.-J. Lai, and S. May (Eds.), *Research Methods in Language and Education, Encyclopedia of Language and Education* (pp. 339–351). Springer.

De Costa, P., and Norton, B. (2016). Identity in language learning and teaching: Research agendas for the future. In S. Preece (Ed.), *The Routledge handbook of language and identity* (1st ed.) (pp. 586–601). Routledge https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315669816.

De Fina, A. (2016). Linguistic practices and transnational identities. In S. Preece (Ed.), *The Routledge handbook of language and identity*, (pp. 163–178). Routledge https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315669816.

Dovyak, N., and Hornsby, M. (2021). Attitudes and Ideologies in Language Revitalisation. In J. Olko, and J. Sallabank (Eds.), *Revitalizing Endangered Languages: A Practical Guide* (pp. 104–117). Cambridge University Press.

Duranti, A. (2000). *Antropología Lingüística*. Cambridge University Press.

European Parliament. (2016). Regional and minority languages in the European Union. Retrieved May 6, 2022, from

https://www.europarl.europa.eu/thinktank/en/document/EPRS_BRI(2016)589794.

Evans, D. (2018). A pedagogy for marginalized language-culture. In D. Evans (Ed.), *Language, Identity and Symbolic Culture* (pp. 259–277). Bloomsburry Academic.

Extra, G., and Gorter, D. (2008). The constellation of languages in Europe: An inclusive approach. *Multilingual Europe: Facts and Policies*, (pp. 3–60). De Gruyter Mouton.

García, O. (2009). *Bilingual Education in the 21st Century: A Global Perspective*. Wiley-Blackwell.

García, O. (2010). Languaging and ethnifying. In J. A. Fishman and O. García (Eds.), *Handbook of Language and Ethnic Identity. Disciplinary and regional perspectives* (pp. 519–534). Oxford University Press.

Garcia, O., and Li, W. (2014). *Translanguaging: Language, bilingualism and education*. Palgrave Macmillan.

Gardner, R. C. (1985). *Social Psychology and Second Language Learning: The Role of Attitudes and Motivation*. Arnold.

Gardner, R. C., and MacIntyre, P. D. (1993). A student's contributions to second- language learning. Part II: Affective variables. *Language Teaching*, *26*(1), 1–11.

Gort, M., and Sembiante, S. F. (2015). Navigating hybridized language learning spaces through translanguaging pedagogy: Dual language preschool teachers' languaging practices in Support of emergent bilingual children's performance of academic dis- course. *International Multilingual Research Journal*, *9*(1), 7–25.

Greene, J. C. (2013). On rhizomes, lines of flight, mangles, and other assemblages. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, *26*(6), 749–758.

Grenfell, M. (2012). Bourdieu, language, and education. In M. Grenfell, D. Bloome, C. Hardy, K. Pahl, J. Rowsell, and V. B. Street (Eds.), *Language, Ethnography, and Education: Bridging New Literacy Studies and Bourdieu* (pp. 50–70.). Routledge.

Heller, M. (2009). Doing Ethnography. In W. Li and M. G. Moyer (Eds.), *The Blackwell Guide to Research Methods in Bilingualism and Multilingualism* (pp. 249–262.). Blackwell.

Heller, M. (2011). *Paths to Post-Nationalism: A Critical Ethnography of Language and Identity*. Oxford UniversityPress.

Hernandez, J. M. (2008). Euskara birpentsatu beharra, ekarpen batzuk antropologia- tik. *Bat: Soziolinguistika aldizkaria*, (69), 27–42.

Hughes, J. A., Randall, D., and Shapiro, D. (1992). From ethnographic record to system design: Some experiences from the field. *Computer Supported Cooperative Work (CSCW)*, *1*(3), pp. 123–141.

Kroskrity, P. V. (2000). *Regimes of language: ideologies, polities, and*

identities. James Currey Publishers.

Jones, K., Martin-Jones, M., and Bhatt, A. (2000). Constructing a critical, dialogic aroach to research on multilingual literacy: Participant diaries and diary interviews. In M. Martin-Jones and K. Jones (Eds.), *Multilingual Literacies: Reading and Writing Different Worlds* (pp. 319–351). John Benjamins.

Lasan, I., and Rehner, K. (2018). Expressing and perceiving identity and intentions in a second language: A preliminary exploratory study of the effect of (extra)curricular contact on sociolinguistic development. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, *21*(6), 632–646.

Leonet, O., Cenoz, J., and Gorter, D. (2017). Challenging minority language isolation: Translanguaging in a trilingual school in the Basque Country. *Journal of Language, Identity and Education*, *16*(4), 216–227.

Leonet, O., Cenoz, J., and Gorter, D. (2020). Developing morphological awareness across languages: Translanguaging pedagogies in third language acquisition. *Language Awareness*, *29*(1), 41–59.

Leung, C., and Valdés, G. (2019). Translanguaging and the transdisciplinary framework for language teaching and learning in a multilingual world. *The Modern Language Journal*, *103*(2), 348–370.

Lewis, G., Jones, B., and Baker, C. (2012). Translanguaging: origins and development from school to street and beyond. *Educational Research and Evaluation*, *18*(7), 641–654.

Makoni, S., and Pennycook, A. (2005). Disinventing and (re) constituting languages. *Critical Inquiry in Language Studies: An International Journal*, *2*(3), 137–156.

Martin-Beltrán, M. (2014). "What do you want to say?" How adolescents use translan- guaging to expand learning oortunities. *International Multilingual Research Journal*, *8*(3), 208–230.

Norton, B. (Ed.) (2013). *Identity and Language Learning: Extending the Conversation* (2nd. ed.). Multilingual Matters.

Otheguy, R., García, O. and Reid, W. (2015). Clarifying Translanguaging and Decon- structing Named Languages: A Perspective From Linguistics. *Applied Linguistics Review, 6* (3), 281–307.

Pavlenko, A. (2002). Poststructuralist approaches to the study of social factors in sec- ond language learning and use. In V. Cook (Ed.), *Portraits of the L2 User* (pp. 277– 302). Multilingual Matters.

Pavlenko, A., and Blackledge, A. (2004). *Negotiation of identities in multilingual contexts* (vol. 45). Multilingual Matters.

Pérez-Izaguirre, E., Correa Gorospe, J. M. and Chaves-Gallastegui, E. (2022). Revisit- ing the Ethics of Basque Educational Ethnographic Research Based on a Post- Qualitative Inquiry: A Proposal for

Inclusive Ethics. In L. Russell, R. Barley, and J. Tummons (Eds.), *Ethics, Ethnography and Education* (Studies in Educational Ethnography, Vol. 19) (pp. 67–86). Emerald Publishing Limited, Bingley. https:// doi.org/10.1108/S1529-210X20220000019005.

Preece, S. (2016). Language and identity in applied linguistics. In S. Preece (Ed.), *The Routledge handbook of language and identity* (pp. 27–42). Routledge https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315669816.

Romaine, S. (2014). The bilingual and multilingual community. In T. K. Bhatia and W. C. Ritchie (Eds.), *The Handbook of Bilingualism and Multilingualism* (pp. 445–466). Blackwell.

Rosiak, K. (2022). The role of language attitudes and ideologies in minority language learning motivation: A case study of Polish migrants' (de)motivation to learn Welsh. *European Journal of Applied Linguistics*. https://doi.org/10.1515/eujal-2021-0018.

Saragueta, E., Galdos, O., and Iturrioz Aguirre, L. (2022). In-service primary teachers' practices and beliefs about multilingualism: Linguistically Sensitive Teaching in the Basque Autonomous Community. *Sustainable Multilingualism*, *21*(1), 143–165.