Assessment and comparison of current media and journalism systems in the Catalan, Galician and Basque languages

Iñaki Zabaleta, Nicolás Xamardo, Arantza Gutierrez, Santi Urrutia and Itxaso Fernandez
University Of The Basque Country

ABSTRACT

This article studies and compares the current print and broadcast media and journalism structures in the Catalan, Galician and Basque linguistic communities, and also the degree of website development among traditional media organizations (press, radio, television). The media systems serving the three autochthonous languages are studied in terms of media type, ownership and circulation. Full-time journalists working in the monolingual minority-language media organizations were assessed in terms of numbers and profiles. The relative weight of the media systems in terms of the population of speakers was also evaluated and results showed that the Catalan and Basque systems were proportionately balanced, contrary to the Galician media, which had a negative relative weight.

KEYWORDS

Catalan language Basque language Galician language media, journalism, website development

INTRODUCTION[1]

Media organizations are key elements in the construction and development of a community. Their functions have been studied for years; beyond their standard tasks as providers of information, correlation, transmission and entertainment, they have other relevant roles aimed at the empowerment of their communities in terms of shared public opinions and spheres, identity construction, language growth, and relations networks (Gans 1979; Lippman 1922; Siebert et al. 1956; van Dijk 2009).

Majority languages (Spanish, English and French) usually have strong press and broadcasting systems that assist in the fulfilment of these functions. More than just linguistic communities, they are linguistic universes. The situ- ation of the minority languages, on the other hand, is much more complex, as the number and reach of their

news organizations are often not sufficient to foster linguistic and cultural dynamism and empower the community, much less to aspire to a linguistic universe.

The study and comparison of news organizations and journalism in the Catalan, Basque and Galician languages (going beyond the borders of the states that constrict them) may help in understanding and assessing these media roles and, indirectly, the 'linguistic vitality' of these languages, to use a term drawn from the notion of ethnolinguistic vitality as used in social psychology and sociolinguistics.

The three linguistic communities account for over 10 million speakers of a total population of over 19 million in the three regions. The Catalan-language community – with an estimated 7.2 million speakers (55.5 per cent) out of a population of 12.9 million – extends over Andorra, the Balearic Islands, the Autonomous Community of Catalonia, the Valencian Community, French Catalonia (that is, the Roussillon region in southern France), the town of Alghero in Sardinia and a few areas in Aragon. The Basque language – with an estimated 0.9 million speakers (32 per cent) out of a population of 2.9 mil- lion (politically divided between the two states of Spain and France) – is spo- ken in the Basque Autonomous Community, Navarre and the French Basque region. Finally, Galician language speakers – estimated as 2.2 million (80 per cent) of a total population of 2.7 million – are spread over the whole geography of Galicia (excluding the large emigrant population).

This article does not limit its scope to the study of traditional media (press, radio and television), but also includes Internet websites built to provide news and other information and interactive services to audiences. Most of the literature on the digital divide refers to economic, sex, age, racial and social division issues usually considered within the spatial and political framework of nation states; however, the possibility of a transversal digital divide within Europe between minority and majority languages and media systems needs also to be recognized.

As for journalism, it is important to know the population and professional profile of journalists working in news organizations, as they are key actors in the production of media content and in interactions with the audience.

LINGUISTIC VITALITY AND LINGUISTIC UNIVERSE

Scholars of endangered and minority languages have developed several concepts and categories to measure linguistic vigour. One of these is ethno- linguistic vitality, a term widely used in social psychology and sociolinguis- tics. However, we prefer to use what

we believe is a broader concept, that of 'linguistic vitality', eliminating the 'ethno' constituent, given that many endangered languages do not correspond nowadays to an ethnic group but represent a civil community with a shared culture and language, as with the Catalan, Basque and Galician cases.

The analysis of (ethno)linguistic vitality is based on a number of different indicators. Giles et al. (1977), in their original version of the concept, meas- ured vitality using three objective categories: status of the linguistic group, demographic factors and institutional support.

The status of the linguistic group contributes to language vitality. The higher the group's economic, social, sociohistorical and language status, the higher its status as a collective entity. Demographic factors – defined in terms of population distribution (national territories, concentration and proportion) and numbers (absolute number of speakers, birth rate, mixed marriages, immigration and emigration) – play a notable role in generat- ing high group vitality. A large or sufficient population of speakers can strengthen the vitality of the group; note, however, that the indicator has to be assessed as a percentage of the overall population of the community and of the speakers of the majority language. Finally, institutional support can reinforce the vitality of a language. This support can be formal – the development of adequate mass media organizations, the educational sys- tem, government services and industry – and informal – through religion and culture.

Giles et al.'s basic and objective framework of the vitality of a language and its speech community was criticized as not incorporating subjective indicators that could reveal the group's perception of its own vitality. It therefore under- went several amendments and modifications, whether to compensate for the absence of subjective vitality (Bourhis et al. 1981) or to expand the model to a new structure with four levels of analysis: social, socio-psychological, psy- chological and language behaviour (Landry and Bourhis 1997). Some years ago the UNESCO Ad Hoc Expert Group on Endangered Languages approved the Recommendations to UNESCO for Action Plans on the Safeguarding of Endangered Languages (Paris 10–12 March 2003) in which nine criteria were established to determine the degree of language endangerment, as follows: (1) intergenerational language transmission; (2) absolute number of speakers; (3) proportion of speakers within the total population; (4) trends in existing language domains (areas of use); (5) response to new domains and media; (6) materials for language education and literacy; (7) governmental and insti- tutional language attitudes and policies, including official status

and use; (8) community members' attitudes towards their own language; and (9) amount and quality of documentation.

Following Fishman's (1991, 2001) eight-level language development scale, the Catalan, Basque and Galician languages might be positioned somewhere between the first and the second levels, as they have a place   in public administration, university and education, and small and medium- sized media, but not so much in major media or centres of financial and economic power. This brings us to the pertinence of the linguistic universe concept.

The idea of a linguistic universe (Zabaleta 1996, 2000, 2003) must be understood as an expansion and transformation of the traditional linguistic community due to the development and use of the new information and communication technologies and the diversification of the community: people and groups along practically the whole continuum and along many axes (culture ethnicity, political identity, language knowledge and use, physical and geo- graphical living distances, etc), representing a whole range of variability. A core of speakers with strong linguistic and social cohesion centres and offers direction to that dispersed and diverse linguistic universe.

The powerful dominant languages (Spanish, French, German and English, among others) are in a favourable position to become linguistic universes, because they can count on a well-established media and telecommunications infrastructure; on a state absolutely aware of its crucial role as an instrument of empowerment and regulation; and on a social community capable of successfully confronting the challenges of market globalization, audience individualization and weak loyalty towards media outlets. However, minority-language communities face severe problems in reaching this kind of integral development. One such problem is an inadequate news media system.

MINORITY-LANGUAGE MEDIA

Research into media organizations and structures is quite widespread in the academic world, but the majority of studies take as their framework of analy- sis the political domain of the state or subordinate levels of government (local, regional). Most international comparative studies also use this unit of analysis (Hanitzsch 2009). This criterion may seem reasonable to most scholars, yet there may be cases where it is appropriate to study the linguistic community because it overcomes the burden of state-induced division, as in our case.

In Europe in the last two decades, scholars and language advocates have made notable efforts to advance the issue of minority languages and empower them in all social and cultural areas. A few international organiza- tions have been established to support minority languages (Mercator Media, European Bureau for Lesser-Used Languages), and, in 1992, the European Council approved a European Charter for Regional and Minority Languages, which entered into force in 1998 and has already been ratified by 23 nation states. However, comparative research (studying several communities at the same time) on minority-language media is still underrepresented in the standard academic literature. In the state-by-state media analysis provided in *The Media in Europe* (Kelly et al. 2004), there are few mentions of minori- ty-language media, and likewise in the study by de Moragas et al. (1999) of decentralized television experiences in the European Union.

Riggins (1992) published an international perspective on ethnic minority media (including cases of aboriginal survival and of immigrants and indig- enous minorities). Hogan-Brun and Wolff (2003) edited a volume on the framework, status and prospects of minority languages in Europe, dealing not only with autochthonous/regional languages, but also with diasporic commu- nities. Kirk and Ó Baoill (2003) edited the results of the Fourth Symposium on Language and Politics dedicated to the broadcasting and press goals of the minority languages of Ireland, Northern Ireland and Scotland. Cormack and Hourigan (2007: back cover) subsequently published a collection of general essays and case studies on minority-language media by fourteen scholars as a 'first attempt to define and develop minority-language media as a distinct field of study'. Zabaleta et al. (2008) surveyed journalists from ten European communities to assess knowledge and use of the minority language in their journalism activity. Browne (1996) focused on the financial problems of indig- enous broadcast media.

Yet publications on the media of single minority-language communi- ties are many (Gifreu 1986; Falkena 2001; Brisaboa et al. 2002; López 2002), and countless are the studies in which the framework is the political/admin- istrative region (the Autonomous Community of Catalonia and the Basque Autonomous Community, for example), where the media belong to both majority and minority languages (Laitin and Rodríguez Gómez 1992; Scolari et al. 2007; de Moragas et al. 2007).

INTERNET AS NEWS MEDIUM

Specific studies on the websites built by traditional media organizations (printed press, radio and television) are relatively few in mainstream research, and even fewer in minority languages. In 1998, a study on the content and structure of the websites of 300 US television stations indicated that they mostly offered text-oriented headline news and programming information (Chan-Olmsted and Park 2000); 76 per cent of them offered top headline news, mostly in simple text format, but only 3.7 per cent offered news web-casting and only 16 per cent provided photos. With regard to communications with web users, the degree of interactivity was quite low; apart from the basic click-to-e-mail service (present in 95.7 per cent of the stations), only 9 per cent had a discussion forum/bulletin and chat room, and only 35 per cent had a feedback form. Another study conducted during the same period reached similar conclusions, and reported that the websites of three important newspapers gave more priority to provide textual information than graphic information (Li 1998).

Things have not improved significantly, even though Schiff (2006) reported eight business models among news websites and found that there was consensus on the interactive model being the most promising in terms of eventually capturing online news consumers. For Franklin (2008), online news services have failed to meet the expectations of interactivity, participation and news storytelling. A study of newspaper website coverage of the 2000 US elections concluded that journalists were normalizing the Internet and mov- ing closer to traditional journalism roles and goals (Singer 2003). In another comparative content analysis of ten online news media in five countries (the United States, France, the United Kingdom, Germany and Russia), Quandt and Singer (2009) reported that most of the websites lacked multi-media content.

RESEARCH QUESTIONS

Rather that a formal hypothesis, we decided to establish the following research questions:

1. What monolingual (70 per cent or more content in the autochthonous language) media systems are there in the Catalan-, Galician- and Basque-language communities in terms of media type, ownership and circula-tion?
2. What comparisons can be made among the three communities?
3. What is the structure of the major monolingual media organizations (press dailies and weeklies, radio and television stations with daily program-ming, general content and broad circulation, and with 70 per cent or more of content in the autochthonous language) in the Catalan-, Galician- and Basque-language communities?

4. What is the degree of Internet development among the traditional mono- lingual media organizations (press, radio and television) in the Catalan, Galician and Basque languages?
5. What is the population and profile of journalists working in Catalan-, Galician- and Basque-language media organizations?
6. What is the relative weight of the three media systems with regard to the respective populations of speakers?

METHODOLOGY

Different methodological procedures were used to study the media systems and their relative weight, the websites, the population of journalists and their profile.

Media systems and websites. The unit of analysis was a monolingual language medium (newspaper/magazine, radio and television) defined as follows: A medium with a publication/broadcasting frequency greater than annual, with general or specialized information content, available to a broad or local public, and with 70 per cent or more of content/programming in the minority language.

The coding form covered several areas: identification details, media type, percentage of content in own language, type of content, ownership, circulation, etc. The variable referring to media type was categorized as press (print news- papers and magazines), radio stations and television channels. Ownership of the news medium was divided into public (owned by public institutions), private (owned by for-profit companies) and social (owned by not-for-profit social organizations). The circulation variable covered two general categories: local, for media organizations reaching towns, municipalities, counties/ provinces; and general, for media organizations distributing/broadcasting to a political community (Catalonia, Balearic Islands, Andorra; Basque Autonomous Community) or to a linguistic community.

To study the typology of websites we set up two categories: (1) simple website (web) of the company or medium with no news service (which may also be called a corporate website), used to provide background information about the news organization; and (2) website with news (web+news), a corporate website with a regularly updated news information service. We did not study cybermedia that were not part of a traditional news organization. It is convenient to bear in mind that there are many other ways of classifying web- sites, such as by function or content, style, or business model.

During 2004–2007 the authors travelled to the three communities, inter- viewed directors, editors, and managers, conducted intensive fieldwork, and explored all kinds of sources. Each news organization was coded in line with the coding form . The final

outcome was a fairly complete database on Catalan, Basque and Galician monolingual minority-language media, updated at the start of 2008.

Population of journalists. As a complementary piece to the media systems, it was decided to estimate the population of full-time and near-full-time journalists and their distribution in relation to the variables of media type, ownership and diffusion.

The operational definition of the journalist was 'a person who has a full- time or near full-time occupation reporting, writing, editing, photographing, broadcasting or directing news stories or other information to the public by established media', analogous to other standard descriptions.

Similar data-gathering techniques were used in the three communities: First, almost all major news organizations (newspapers/magazines, radio and television stations of general content and diffusion) as well as a sizeable and stratified amount of local and specialized outlets were contacted to provide their number of journalists; second, the same request was addressed to asso- ciations and federations that coordinate local press and broadcast media (In Galicia, Emisoras Municipais Galegas (EMUGA), linked to 14 radio stations; in the Basque community, Topagunea, federation of Basque-language local media with several radio and TV stations and over thirty papers and maga- zines; in the Catalan community, Federació de Ràdios Locals de Catalunya, Canal Local Català, and Premsa Forana from Majorca); third, for those media outlets with no number of journalists yet a global remainder value was cal- culated on the basis of average figures per outlet, established after consult- ing different sources and experts (Federació de Televisions Locals de les Illes Balears, Col·legi de Periodistes de Catalunya and Sindicat de Periodistes de Catalunya, among others). In any event, while it has to be acknowledged that it's almost impossible to get an exact figure due to different circumstances (some journalists work in a partially bilingual assignment; others combine dif- ferent tasks that may go beyond strict journalism, etc.), our final estimate can reasonably represent the actual population.

In the Galician and Basque communities the distribution of journalists by media type, ownership and diffusion was calculated from practically the whole population of newsworkers (over 90% of the journalists in all cases). In the Catalan community, however, due to the large media system, a stratified sample of 148 news organizations was selected and journalists working in those outlets were coded and counted. The difference between the media sample and the actual media system was less than 5 per cent in the media-type vari- able and less than 9 per cent in ownership and diffusion which indicates

the adequacy of the sampling and reinforces the validity of the results.

Profile of journalists. Once the media maps were coded and the results drawn up, a questionnaire was prepared and distributed to a weighted sample of journalists in the three communities. Age and years working in the minority-language medium were part of the survey, in addition to other topics (working conditions, use of language, technology skills, etc).

The sample was calculated by taking the square root of each community's estimated total number of journalists, a standard statistical procedure for cases in which differences among the groups of data are highly skewed (Wimmer and Dominick 1983; Rummel 1970). In this way, the data for the Catalan, Basque and Galician journalists were transformed into a normal distribution.

The proportion of the sample in terms of media type, ownership and circulation was very similar to the actual distribution of the population. Thus, 138 journalists (82 Catalan, 31 Basque and 25 Galician journalists) were included in the survey.

RESULTS

Media systems

The media systems of the three languages, with a total estimate of 949 outlets, were quite distinct in terms of media type distribution, as Table 1 shows. The Catalan-language media structure, composed of an estimated 796 monolingual media organizations (operationally defined as those with 70 per cent or more of their content in the autochthonous language) showed a fairly balanced distribution between monolingual media organizations (press, 42.4 per cent; radio, 37.4 per cent; and television, 20.2 per cent). In the Basque-language media system, with an estimated 108 monolingual organizations, the print media (64.8 per cent) were predominant. In the Galician system, for an estimated 45 organizations, the radio sector (66.7 per cent) was the most prolific.

	Press (%)	Radio (%)	TV (%)	Total	Press–Radio–TV ratio
Catalan	42.4	37.4	20.2	796	2–2–1
Basque	64.8	28.7	6.5	108	10–4–1
Galician	31.1	66.7	2.2	45	14–30–1
Total	44.4	37.8	17.8	949	2–2–1

Table 1: Media types (Data updated to January 2008).
N= 949 media organizations.

When expressed as monolingual press–radio–television ratios, the Catalan ratio was 2–2–1 (two print media and two radio stations for each television station), the Basque ratio was 10–4–1 (ten newspapers/magazines and four radio stations for each television channel), and the Galician ratio was 14–30–1 (fourteen print media and 30 radio channels for each television channel). The media systems in these communities were therefore very asymmetric.

When we looked at the media according to ownership (Table 2), we identified two basic models: publicly owned media organizations were the majority in the Galician- (68.9 per cent) and Catalan- (48.5 per cent) language communities, whereas socially owned media (56.5 per cent) were the majority in the Basque community. With regard to the private media, the percentages were quite similar in the three communities, with a range that varied by less than 8 percentage points. The very small presence of socially owned media (4.4 per cent) in the Galician-language community was particularly noteworthy.

Finally, with regard to circulation, the media systems of the three communities were very similar; as would be expected, local media (town and county level circulation) were dominant in the Catalan- (89.2 per cent), Galician- (79.5 per cent) and Basque- (79.1 per cent) language communities; media with general distribution or reach were situated in the 10–22 per cent bracket (10.8, 20.5, and 20.9 per cent in Catalonia, Galicia and the Basque Country, respectively).

	Public (%)	Private (%)	Social (%)
Catalan	46.9	34.4	18.7
Basque	18.5	25.0	56.5
Galician	68.9	26.7	4.4
Total	46.1	32.1	21.8

Table 2: Media ownership (Data updated to January 2008).
N=939 media organizations coded on the variable of ownership out of a total estimate of 949 (info on 10 outlets not available)

Major monolingual media

Another comparison refers to the degree of development of major monolingual media organizations, that is, monolingual media with general content and broad circulation, published/broadcasted with a weekly or greater frequency (daily newspapers, weeklies, radio stations and television channels).

In 2008, the Catalan-language media included an estimated 26 major media organizations (five dailies, eight weeklies, six radio stations and seven television channels),[2] whereas the Basque-language media included seven major media organizations (one daily, four weeklies, one radio station, one television channel),[3] and the Galician-language media included four major media organizations (one daily, one weekly, one radio station, one television channel).[4]

If we compare the major media systems with speaker populations, the ratio is 133,200 Basque speakers per major Basque medium; 276,425 Catalan speakers per major Catalan medium; and 540,000 Galician speakers per major Galician medium. Thus, with respect to the speaker population, for each major news organization in the Basque community, the Catalan-language community has 0.5 and the Galician community has 0.25 major news organizations. This is probably an indication of stronger Basque social vitality than Catalan and Galician with regard to the establishment of major media organizations.

Traditional media websites

In early 2008,[5] 31.7 per cent of traditional media organizations (press, radio and television) in the three communities did not have any kind of website (Table 3). This non-presence on the Internet affected 32.9 per cent of Catalan,[6] 27.8 per cent of Basque[7] and 20 per cent of Galician media organizations.[8]

It is also striking that a mere 21.6 per cent of the 949 traditional media organizations had a website that included a news information service of some kind that was updated with a certain frequency (what we call web+news). The poorest result was found for the Catalan-language community, where only 18.7 per cent of media organizations had an updated information service within a website, compared to 33 per cent for the Basque and 44.4 per cent for the Galician media community.

	Web (%)	Web+News (%)	No Web (%)	Total
Catalan	48.4	18.7	32.9 (262)	796
Basque	38.9	33.3	27.8 (30)	108
Galician	35.6	44.4	20.0 (9)	45
Total	46.7	21.6	31.7 (301)	949

Table 3: Websites among traditional news media (2008*).
N=949 media organizations with 70 per cent or more of general or specialized content in the autochthonous language. (*) Data updated to January 2008.

	Public (%)	Social (%)	Private (%)
Catalan	55.3	23.6	21.1
Basque	10.0	73.3	16.7
Galician	44.4	0.0	55.6
Total	50.0	28.3	21.7

Table 4: Media with no websites according to ownership type (Data updated to January 2008) N=276 media organizations with no websites were coded on the variable of ownership out of a total estimate of 301 outlets without a website (info on 25 outlets not available).

Going back to the traditional media organizations without websites, the 262 Catalan news organizations with no Internet presence were quite evenly distributed in the three sectors (34 per cent in print, 35.9 per cent in radio and

30.2 per cent in television). Of the 30 Basque media organizations without a website, the majority were print organizations (73.3 per cent) and radio sta- tions (20 per cent), and similarly in Galicia, where the nine organizations with- out a website belonged to the printed press (55.6 per cent) and radio sectors (44.4 per cent).

Ownership of media with no website was also examined (Table 4). For the three communities as a whole, 50 per cent of all media organizations without a website were owned by public institutions, 28.3 per cent by social institutions and 21.7 per cent by private media. Looking at the data in more depth, however, there were evident differences between the language communities. While most of the Catalan media with no Internet presence belonged to the public sector (55.3 per cent), in the Basque community they were owned by social organizations (73.3 per cent) and in the Galician community they were owned by private and public news organizations (55.6 per cent and 44.4 per cent, respectively).

We can interpret these results as follows: (1) Catalan private and social media had a more advanced and favourable attitude to the Internet than public news organizations; (2) Basque social media were clearly lagging behind pri- vate and public media; and (3) given that there were hardly any social media in Galicia (a mere 4.4 per cent), private and public media without websites were almost evenly distributed (55.6 and 44.4 per cent, respectively).

As would be expected, due perhaps to more limited human and economic resources, the vast majority of media without a website were of local diffusion in the three communities (98.8, 83.2 and 100 per cent in Catalonia, the Basque Country and Galicia, respectively).

Journalist numbers and profiles

In 2008, it was estimated that 5049 full-time journalists were working in the three communities: 3952 in Catalonia (78.3 per cent), 633 in the Basque Country (12.5 per cent) and 464 in Galicia (9.2 per cent).With regard to media type (Table 5), Catalan media journalists were distributed quite evenly across the three sectors (press, radio and television, 36.2, 33.2 and 30.6 per cent, respec- tively). In the Basque-language community, however, the dominant sector was the press (50.6 per cent), followed by television (29.1 per cent) and radio (20.4 per cent). Most Galician-language journalists worked in radio (55.6 per cent), followed by television (30.2 per cent), with the press lagging well behind (14.2 per cent).

	Press	Radio	TV	Total
Catalan	36.2% (1430)	33.2% (1311)	30.6% (1211)	3952 (78.3%)
Basque	50.6% (320)	20.4% (129)	29.1% (184)	633 (12.5%)
Galician	14.2% (66)	55.6% (258)	30.2% (140)	464 (9.2%)
Total	36.0% (1816)	33.6% (1698)	30.4% (1535)	5049 (100%)

Table 5: Journalists by media type (Data updated to January 2008).
N= 5049 full-time journalists.

The media ownership variable yielded two clearly differentiated models (Table 6). In the Catalan- and Basque-language communities, the number of journalists working in public and private media was divided almost equally (40–52 per cent), with a difference of less than five percentage points in each community. In the Galician-language community, almost all the journalists were working in public media (87.9 per cent), very few in private media (11.8 per cent) and almost none in social media (0.2 per cent).

In terms of circulation, composed of two categories (general and local), journalists working in media of general circulation (linguistic or political com- munity reach) were the majority in the three communities, although the per- centages differed significantly, at 79.3 per cent in Catalonia, 63.4 per cent in the Basque Country and 50.9 per cent in Galicia.

In terms of gender, the presence of female journalists in the media of the three linguistic communities is noteworthy, as 53.3 per cent of Basque,

51.7 per cent of Galician and 44.9 per cent of Catalan journalists in 2008 were women.

With regard to age and number of years working in minority-language media, our

estimates indicate that journalists in the three communities were 36.4 years old on average (36.7 years in Catalonia, 34.7 years in the Basque Country and 37.5 years in Galicia) and had been working in their own language media for about 12.5 years (11.6 years, Catalonia; 12.4 years, Basque country; and 11.6 years, Galicia).

	Public (%)	Private (%)	Social (%)
Catalan	51.9	46.2	1.9
Basque	40.9	39.5	19.7
Galician	87.9	11.8	0.2
Total	54.8	40.4	4.9

Table 6: Journalists by media ownership (Data updated to January 2008). N=3258 journalists out of a total population of 5049, coded from a sample of 144 media organizations (see methodology).

Relative media system weights

The above tables and results have focused on media systems and the popula- tion of journalists. It is also important to evaluate the relative weight of each system with respect to the three media systems together and with respect to the speaker population for the language communities.

From Table 7 it can be observed that while the Catalan-language media represent 83.9 per cent of the total media (aggregate for the three communities), the Catalan-speaking population corresponds to 69.8 per cent of the total of 10.2 million speakers (aggregate for the three communities). Therefore, the positive difference for the media system of 14 per cent represents one-sixth of the media percentage.

The Basque media relative weight is also positive (11.4 per cent of media weight and 9.1 per cent of speaker weight), with the difference of 2.3 per cent representing one-fifth of the media percentage (and thus, quite similar to the weight for Catalonia).

The Galician-language media system is in a poorer situation since the relative weight of its media system is 4.7 per cent but Galician speakers represent 21.1 per cent of the total speaking population, representing a 16.3 per cent negative difference.

Looking at the number of speakers per media organization, there were 8991 Catalan speakers, 8633 Basque speakers and 48,000 Galician speakers for each media organization in each community. Again, data for the Catalan and Basque media systems

were similar, and quite different for the Galician media.

Finally, there were five Catalan, 5.9 Basque and 10.3 Galician journalists per media organization. Once more, the Catalan and Basque figures were similar, whereas the Galician figure reflected a different situation.

	Pop. (in millions).[1]	Speakers (in millions)[1]	Speakers/ Pop.	Media/ Total media (A)	Spea- kers/ Total speakers (B)	(A)–(B)	Speakers per media org.	Journa- lists per media org.	Spea- kers per major media org.
Catalan	12.9	7.2	55.5%	83.9%	69.8%	14.0%	8991	5.0	286,282
Basque	2.9	0.9	32.0%	11.4%	9.1%	2.3%	8633	5.9	133,200
Galician	2.7	2.2	80.0%	4.7%	21.1%	−16.3%	48,000	10.3	540,000
Total	19.6	10.2	52.4%	100%	100%	0.0	10,800	5.3	284,707

Table 7: Relative weight of media systems.

Sources of population and speakers: Institut d'Estadística de Catalunya, Generalitat de Catalunya, Govern d'Andorra, Institut Valencià d'Estadística, Institut National de la Statistique et des Études Économiques, Instituto Nacional de Estadística (INE), EUSTAT, Instituto de Estadística de Navarra, Instituto Galego de Estatística (IGE).
Note: (1) Data for 2001–2008, total population and language speakers 2 years old and older.

Media weight of the political territories

Since the Catalan- and Basque-language communities are divided into several political territories, it is also interesting to measure relative weights with regard to the total media system for each community. To facilitate the interpretation, we divided the two language communities into two categories: (1) the main political region where most speakers live (Catalonia and the Basque Autonomous Community, respectively); and (2) the aggregate of the rest of areas where the language is spoken (Catalan in Andorra, the Balearic Islands, the Valencian Community, French Catalonia and other smaller areas; and Basque in Navarre and the French Basque region).

According to our estimates, of the Catalan and Basque news organizations,

84.5 per cent and 80.6 per cent, respectively, are located in the Autonomous Community of Catalonia and in the Basque Autonomous Community, indicating that their respective media weights were quite similar.

However, if we compare these media weight values with the speaker weights in the two political territories (percentage of speakers with respect to the total linguistic population), the media weight of Catalonia, at 84.5 per cent, turns out to be 20.3

percentage points higher than its linguistic weight of 64.3 per cent (calculated by dividing its 4.6 million speakers by an estimated 7.2 million Catalan speakers). In the case of the Basque Autonomous Community, however, the difference between media weight (80.6 per cent) and linguistic weight (82.6 per cent) is very small (2 percentage points). In terms of media power, therefore, Catalonia seems to play a more active and vital role within its language population than does the Basque Autonomous Community within its language population.

SYNTHESIS AND DISCUSSION

Media systems

The structure of the Catalan-, Basque- and Galician-language media systems is significantly different in terms of size and media type. We estimate that, in 2008, there were 796 Catalan, 108 Basque and 45 Galician monolingual print, radio and television organizations, representing eighteen Catalan and two Basque media organizations for each Galician media organization. These comparative figures are a first indication of different development levels.

With regard to media type, while more than two-thirds of the media organizations belong to the print media in the Basque system and to radio in the Galician system, there is a remarkable balance in the Catalan system among the three sectors, with two press media and two radio stations for every television channel. This fact would suggest that Catalonia has a more normalized media system.

The ownership variable uncovered issues that are not so evident in   the media type variable. The fact that more than two-thirds of Galician- language media are publicly owned indicates a very strong dependence on public funding (city councils and regional government) and the likelihood of political influence being wielded by the party in power (bearing in mind, nonetheless, that private media often have a very clear political agenda and ideology in their journalistic and editorial policy). Something similar could be said about the Catalan-language media, since public institutions own almost half of all the media organizations. In both systems, most of the public media organizations are radio or television stations. The divergence arises in the Basque media system, where more than half of the media are operated by non-profit organizations and only 18 per cent are publicly owned. This is one possible explanation for the powerful social and grassroots activity around the Basque language.

The circulation variable does not reveal any significant difference, since around four-fifths of the media organizations in the three media systems are locally circulated and only one-fifth has general reach.

Websites

Almost one-third of the traditional monolingual media in the Catalan-, Basque- and Galician-language communities do not have a website. Moreover, less than one-quarter have a website that includes a regularly updated news service. These facts would indicate deficient Internet development, mostly occurring in the locally distributed media.

With regard to ownership, over half of the Catalan media organizations without a website are public, which apparently indicates a cautious and non- urgent attitude towards the Internet. However, this explanation seems per- haps too straightforward when we observe that close to three-quarters of the Basque organizations without Internet presence are owned by social organizations and belong to the print sector. In Galicia, non-presence on the Internet is greater among private and social media. Therefore, given that it is not a complex matter to design and upload a simple website, there may be other reasons to explain this slow growth in digital convergence. In some instances it may be due to insufficient resources, expertise and financing; alternatively, media editors and managers may prefer a more physical and direct communication with their community and/or audience using print and traditional broadcast radio or television. In any case, it seems that this limited Internet presence may represent another barrier to digital convergence.

Journalists

According to our estimates, in 2008 there were 3952 Catalan, 633 Basque and 464 Galician full-time journalists working in their own language media. The distribution by media type paralleled that of the media structure; thus, while Catalan journalists are quite evenly distributed in the three sectors, half of the Basque and Galician newspeople work in the print media and radio, respectively.

In the Catalan and Basque ownership model most journalists work in public and private media (with similar percentages), while in the Galician owner- ship model, nine of ten newspeople are employed in public media.

The gender and profiles of journalists are very similar in the three com- munities: half

are female, the average age is around 36, and experience in the sector is around twelve years. If we bear in mind that, in the United States of America in 2002, only 33 per cent of all journalists working for the traditional mainstream media were female (Weaver 2006),[9] these results seem reassuring.

Relative weights

The relative weights of the Catalan- and Basque-language media systems are similar with respect to their speaking population, but in comparison with Catalonia and the Basque Country, Galicia has a small number of media organizations for a large speaker population (there are around 8000 Catalan and Basque language speakers per media organization compared to 48,000 Galician language speakers). Likewise, while there are five Catalan and Basque journalists per news organization, in the Galician media system that number doubles to ten. A word of caution is needed here, however, since a smaller number of journalists per medium is not necessarily good in terms of content quality, even if it makes economic sense.

Shifting to the political territory, the Catalan-language media system has more weight with respect to the total Catalan speaking population than does the Basque-language media system with respect to the total Basque speaking population. Indeed, although four-fifths of Catalan and Basque media organizations are located (correspondingly) in Catalonia and the Basque Country, the former has a lower linguistic weight than the latter and, therefore, its quantitative media strength appears greater.

In conclusion, the media and journalism systems of the three language communities share two common aspects: young and experienced journalists on the positive side, and a deficient presence of the local media on the Internet on the negative side. The Catalan media system is balanced in terms of media type and has a substantial public sector; the Basque media system is notably anchored in the printed press and social ownership; and the Galician media system is perhaps excessively dominated by radio and public ownership. In terms of relative degrees of development, the Catalan and Basque media seem to have a comparable level with respect to their speaking population, but the Galician system lags behind.

The three languages, surrounded as they are by the powerful Spanish- language media system (and even French in the case of the Catalan and Basque languages), need stronger and more sustainable media systems that would enable their communities to develop as linguistic universes. In this endeavour, the cooperation of public and social

institutions and actors, as well as adequate media support policies, is paramount. The data and suggestions presented here can provide practical guidance.

---

1. This article is part of a larger project on European Minority Language Media and Journalism in ten communities (Basque, Catalan, Galician, Corsican, Breton, Frisian, Irish, Welsh, Scottish-Gaelic and Sámi). We would like to thank all that helped us preparing this study and, specially, Carme Ferré Pavia from the Autonomous University of Barcelona.
2. eriòdic de Catalunya, Diari de Balears, Diari d'Andorra. Radio: RAC1. Catalunya Ràdio, Ràdio Nacional d'Andorra, Ràdio9-RadioNou, IB3 Ràdio and Comradio (a consortium of about 100 city radio stations, controlled by the Provincial Council of Barcelona and managed by the Consorci de Comunicació Local). Television: TV3, Canal 33, TVC SAT, TVC INTERNACIONAL, IB3, Canal Català TV (network of local stations with syndicated programming) and Andorra Televisiò.
3. Daily: Berrria (after the closure of Egunkaria by the Spanish government). Radio: Euskadi Irratia. Television: ETB1.
4. Daily: Galixia Hoxe. Radio: Radio Galega. Television: TVG.
5. It is likely that, since our last data update in 2008, some media organizations have created a website.
6. In the Catalan community, the majority of media with no websites were of local circulation. Press: Bellpuig, Ebre Press, El Cresol, Felanitx, L'Estany, Delta del Llobregat, L'Hora del Garraf, etc. Radio: Ràdio Municipal de Montuïri, Ràdio Tossa, etc. Television: TV Vilanova del Vallès, Tortosa TLB (Televisió de Manresa), TV Solsona, Televisiò Pla de l'Estany and Canal Català Maresme, among others.
7. In the Basque linguistic community, of the 30 media organizations with no website, 25 had local and five had broad circulation. Broad circulation press: UNESCO Aldizkaria (published in Donostia), Maiatz (Baiona), Ipurbeltz (Donostia), Ikastola Aldizkaria (Donostia) and Herria (Baiona). Local circulation press: Zorrotz-Morrotz (published in Zorrotza), Ze Berri (Eskoriatza), UK (Getxo), Txaparro (Zarautz), Pulunpe (Larraintzar), Prest (Bilbo), Pil-pilean (Soraluce), Maxixatzen (Azkoitia), Mailope (Araitz), Lau Haizeetara (Errenteria), Kontzejupetik (Oñati), Kalaputxi (Mutriku), Irunero (Irun), Drogetenitturri (Ermua), Danbolin (Zestoa), Begitu (Arratia) and Artzape (Getaria). Local radio stations: Kaka Flash (Azpeitia), Arreta Irratia (Ermua), Arlote Irratia (Ordizia), Radixu (Ondarroa), Oñati Irratia (Oinati) and Oiartzun Irratia (Oiartzun). Local television stations: Xaloa Telebista (Baztan) and Urdaibai Telebista (Gernika).
8. In the Galician community there were nine media organizations with no website, as follows: Fadamorgana (a broadly circulated quarterly cultural magazine); four monthly papers with general content and local circulation (Terra Chá Xa, El Periódico de Lalín y Comarca, El Confidencial de Costa da Morte and A Comarca do Morrazo); and four daily-broadcast local radio stations with general content (Radio Quiroga, Radio Melide, Radio Boiro, and Radio As Nogais.
9. Among journalists with less than five years' work experience, women outnumber men, at 54.2 per cent.

REFERENCES

Bourhis, R. Y., Giles, H. and Rosenthal, D. (1981), 'Notes on the Construction of a Subjective Vitality Questionnaire for Ethnolinguistic Groups', *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 2:2, pp. 145–55.
Brisaboa, N. R., Penabad, M. R., Places, A. S., Rodriguez, F. J., Sanjulián, C. F., Fontáiña, L. T., Modia, C. L. and Fernández, C. V. (2002), 'BVG: Una Biblioteca

Virtual de Literatura Gallega', *Mercator Media Forum*, 6:1, pp. 62–79.

Browne, D. (1996), *Electronic Media and Indigenous Peoples: A Voice of Our Own?,* Ames (Iowa): University of Iowa Press.

Chan-Olmsted, S. M. and Park, J. S. (2000), 'From On-Air to Online World: Examining The Content and Structures of Broadcast TV Stations' Websites', *Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly*, 77:2, pp. 321–39.

Cormack, M. and Hourigan, N. (eds) (2007), *Minority Language Media*, Clevedon (UK): Multilingual Matters.

de Moragas i Spà, M., Fernández Alonso, I., Blasco Gil, J. J., Guimerà I Orts, J. À., Corbella I Cordomí, J. M., Civil i Serra, M. and Gibert i Fortuny, O. (eds) (2007), *Informe de la Comunicación en Cataluña 2005–2006*, Bellaterra (Barcelona): Ediciones UAB.

de Moragas, M., Garitaonandia, C. and López, B. (eds) (1999), *Television on your Doorstep: Decentralisation Experiences in the European Union,* Luton (UK): University of Luton Press.

Dijk, T. A. van (2009), 'News, Discourse and Ideology', in K. Wahl-Jorgensen and T. Hanitzsch (eds), *The Handbook of Journalism Studies*, Abingdon Oxon: Routledge, pp. 191–204.

Falkena, O. (2001), 'www.omropfryslan.nl: The Development of a Frisian-language Multimedia Website', *Mercator Media Forum,* 5, pp. 42–7.

Fishman, J. A. (1991), *Reversing Language Shift: Theoretical and Empirical Foundations of Assistance to Threatened Languages,* Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.

—— (ed.) (2001), *Can Threatened Languages Be Saved? Reversing Language Sift Revisited: A 21st Century Perspective,* Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.

Franklin, B. (2008), 'The Future of Newspapers', *Journalism Studies,* 9:5, pp. 630–41.

Gans, H. J. (1979), *Deciding What's News,* New York: Random House.

Gifreu, J. (1986), 'From Communication Policy to Reconstruction of Cultural Identity: Prospects for Catalonia', *European Journal of Communication,* 1:4, pp. 463–76.

Giles, H., Bourhis, R. and Yaylor, D. (1977), 'Towards a theory of language in ethnic group relations', in H. Giles (ed.), *Language, Ethnicity and Intergroup Relations*, London: Academic Press, pp. 307–48.

Hanitzsch, T. (2009), 'Comparative Journalism Studies', in K. Wahl-Jorgensen and T. Hanitzsch (eds), *The Handbook of Journalism Studies*, Abingdon Oxon: Routledge, pp. 413–27.

Hogan-Brun, G. and Wolff, S. (2003), 'Minority languages in Europe: An introduction to the current debate', in G. Hogan-Brun, and S. Wolff (eds), *Minority Languages in Europe: Frameworks, Status, Prospects*, London: Palgrave MacMillan, pp. 3–15.

Kelly, M., Mazzoleni, G. and Mcquail, D. (eds) (2004), *The Media in Europe,* London, Sage Publications.

Kirk, J. and Ó Baoill, D. P. (eds) (2003), *Towards our Goals in Broadcasting, the Press, the Performing Arts and the Economy: Minority Languages in Northern Ireland, the Republic of Ireland, and Scotland,* Belfast: Queens's University Belfast.

Laitin, D. D. and Rodríguez Gómez, G. (1992), 'Language, Ideology and the Press in Catalonia', *American Antropologist,* 94:1, pp. 9–30.

Landry, R. and Bourhis, R. Y. (1997), 'Linguistic landscape and ethnolinguistic vitality: An empirical study', *Journal of Language and Social Psychology,* 16:1, pp. 23–49.

Lanweeder, L. M. (2000), 'Indicators of ethnolinguistic vitality', *Notes on Sociolinguistics,* 5:1, pp. 5–22.

Li, X. (1998), 'Web Page Design and Graphic Use of Three US Newspapers', *Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly,* 75:2, pp. 353–65.

Lippman, W. (1922), *Public Opinion,* New York: Macmillan.

López, B. (2002), 'Esperanzas en la Red: Vilaweb como Ejemplo Exitoso de Medio de Comunicacion Online en una Lengua Minoritaria', *Mercator Media Forum,* 6, pp. 37–57.

Quandt, T. and Singer, J. B. (2009), 'Convergence and Cross-Platform Content Production', in K. Wahl-Jorgensen and T. Hanitzsch (eds), *Journalism Studies*, Abingdon Oxon:

Routledge, pp. 130–44.

Riggins, S. H. (ed.) (1992), *Ethnic Minority Media,* London: Sage.

Rummel, R. J. (1970), *Factor Analysis,* Chicago: Northwestern University Press.

Schiff, F. (2006), 'Business Models of News Websites: A Survey of Empirical Trends and Expert Opinion', *First Monday.* Special Issue No. 6: Commercial Applications of the Internet (Originally published in June 2003). http://first-monday.org/htbin/cgiwrap/bin/ojs/index.php/fm/article/view/1061/981. Accessed 31 May 2005.

Scolari, C., Jarque, J. M., Perales, C., Navarro, H. and Coll, I. (2007), 'El canvi digital als mitjans de proximitat. Les transformacions generades per la introducció de les tecnologies digitals en les redaccions de la premsa comar- cal i les ràdios i televisions locals', *Lexicon Papers*, Barcelona: Departament de la Presidència de la Generalitat de Catalunya. The authors, members of the Grup de Recerca d'Interaccions Digitals (GRID – UVic) first presented the paper at the II Convenció Catalana de la Premsa Comarcal i Local, Santa Coloma de Queralt (Conca del Barberà, Tarragona), 24 April 2007, organized by the Associació Catalana de Premsa Comarcal.

Siebert, F., Petersen, T. and Schramm, W. (1956), *Four Theories of the Press*, Chicago: University of Illinois Press.

Singer, J. B. (2003), 'Campaign Contributions: Online Newspapers Coverage of Election 2000', *Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly*, 80:1, pp. 39–56.

Weaver, D. H. (2006), *The American Journalist in the 21st Century: US News People at the Dawn of a New Millennium,* New York: Routledge.

Wimmer, R. D. and Dominick, J. R. (1983), *Mass Media Research: An Introduction*, Belmont, CA (USA): Wadsworth Publishers.

Zabaleta, I. (1996), 'Culture and language universe for the Basque Community', in M. Ledo Andión (ed.), *Comunicación na periferia atlántica: Actas do I Congreso Internacional*, Santiago de Compostela: Universidad de Santiago de Compostela, pp. 215–22.

—— (2000), 'La comunidad lingüística como universo: una perspectiva desde Euskal Herria ante los nuevos sistemas de comunicación', in M. Treserras (ed.) *Trípodos: The Impact of Information and Communication Technologies on Social Realities*, First International Conference on Communication and Reality, Barcelona: Facultat de Ciéncies de la Comunicació Blanquerna, pp. 193–204.

—— (2003), 'The Forgotten Europe of Small Language Media and the Basque Experience', in A. Schorr, W. Campbell and M. Schenk (eds), *Communication Research and Media Science in Europe*, Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter, pp. 535–50.

Zabaleta, I., Xamardo, N., Gutierrez, M. A., Urrutia, S. and Fernández Astobiza, I. (2008), 'Language Development, Knowledge and Use Among Journalists of European Minority Language Media', *Journalism Studies,* 9:2, pp. 195–211.